



# CITY COUNCIL SPECIAL MEETING

MARCH 22, 2023

3:00 PM

SULLIVAN CHAMBER

---

~MINUTES~

---

MEETING

Wednesday, March 22, 2023

TIME

3:00 PM

PRESIDING OFFICER

Mayor Sumbul Siddiqui

Minutes Acceptance: Minutes of Mar 22, 2023 3:00 PM (Submission of the Record)

**THE CITY COUNCIL WILL HOLD A SPECIAL MEETING IN ORDER TO RECEIVE AN UPDATE ON THE CHARTER REVIEW**

| Attendee Name     | Present                             | Absent                              | Late                                | Arrived |
|-------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|---------|
| Burhan Azeem      | <input type="checkbox"/> Remote     | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |         |
| Dennis J. Carlone | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |         |
| Alanna Mallon     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |         |
| Marc C. McGovern  | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | 3:07 PM |
| Patricia Nolan    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |         |
| E. Denise Simmons | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |         |
| Paul F. Toner     | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | 3:07 PM |
| Quinton Zondervan | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |         |
| Sumbul Siddiqui   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |         |

Minutes Acceptance: Minutes of Mar 22, 2023 3:00 PM (Submission of the Record)

**MINUTES OF THE CAMBRIDGE CITY COUNCIL  
SPECIAL MEETING**

**March 22, 2023**

A Special Meeting of the Cambridge City Council was held on March 22, 2023. The meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by the Honorable Mayor Sumbul Siddiqui. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this public meeting was hybrid, allowing participation in person, in the Sullivan Chamber, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, City Hall, 795 Massachusetts Avenue, Cambridge, MA and by remote participation via zoom.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui called the meeting to order and asked the Clerk to call the roll. City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.**

Councillor Burhan Azeem – Present/Remote & In Person  
Councillor Dennis J. Carlone – Present/In Sullivan Chamber  
Vice Mayor Alanna M. Mallon – Present/In Sullivan Chamber  
Councillor Marc C. McGovern – Absent \*  
Councillor Patricia Nolan – Present/In Sullivan Chamber  
Councillor E. Denise Simmons – Absent  
Councillor Paul Toner – Absent\*  
Councillor Quinton Y. Zondervan – Present/In Sullivan Chamber  
Mayor Sumbul Siddiqui – Present/In Sullivan Chamber

**Present-6. Absent-3. Quorum established.**

**\*Councillor McGovern joined at 3:07 p.m. and was in person. Councillor Toner joined at 3:07 p.m. and was remote.**

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui noted that the purpose of this Special Meeting is to receive an update on the work of the Charter Review Committee.**

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized the following individuals who offered comments relative to the Charter Review. Each was allowed up to three minutes to speak.**

James Williamson, Churchill Avenue, Cambridge noted the lack of democracy, spoke in favor of an elected Mayor with power, and asked that a survey be done.

Heather Hoffman, 213 Hurley Street, Cambridge, MA, called for more democracy and asked that the City Council give the Charter Review Committee the additional time they are requesting to do their work.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui noted that before the City Council is a communication received from the Chair of the Charter Review Committee, Kathleen Born transmitting a letter and report, and a copy of the presentation.** The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui also noted that the City Clerk had provided copies of the recently ordained Municipal Ordinance related to the Charter Review Committee. Mayor Siddiqui acknowledged the Charter Review Committee and expressed her gratitude for their commitment and the work they have accomplished to date, noting that they have taken on a daunting task.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Charter Review Committee Chair, Kathleen Born who introduced Project Manager Anna Corning and Michael Ward, Director of the Collins Center, and Associate Elizabeth Corbo from the Collins Center.** Chair Born also acknowledged members of the Charter Review Committee who were present including Lisa Peterson, Kaleb Abebe and Patrick Magee.

Chair Kathleen Born provided the City Council with an update noting how the Committee has moved forward with its work and what remains to be done. Chair Born expressed her gratitude to the Committee members and congratulated the Council on selecting an amazing group that truly represents the diversity of Cambridge. Chair Born turned it over to Anna Corning who made a presentation that was provided to the public in advance of the meeting and shown on the screen. Copy attached.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui asked if the Committee had guiding questions for the Council like what they had for the School Committee. Chair Born indicated that she thought Councillors would have their own questions formulated.**

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor McGovern who had questions related to the recently passed ordinance.** Mayor Siddiqui and Councillor Nolan responded.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor Zondervan for comments and questions.** Councillor Zondervan thanked the Committee for their work and taking on this daunting assignment. Councillor Zondervan asked if there was consideration being given to having additional elected bodies. Director Ward responded noting various government structures in other communities. It was also noted that various boards and commissions could be elected bodies. Councillor Zondervan also asked what the discussion has been around an elected executive. Chair Born noted that there has been conversation around the City Manager Executive Form of Government versus a strong Mayor and models for a strong city that would include having a Chief Executive Officer or a Chief Operating and Financial Officer. Representatives from the Collins Center also responded. Councillor Zondervan asked if a traditional strong Mayor form of government was still in the mix of options being considered. Chair Born and the team responded that it was.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor Nolan for comments and questions.**

Councillor Nolan asked Chair Born to convey to every member of the Committee her appreciation and acknowledgment of the important work that they are doing and the investment of time and emotional energy they are giving. Councillor Nolan asked what the public input process has been to date and what support the Committee needs to have an even more robust public input process moving forward. Councillor Nolan also asked about the balance of power and the role of the executive and the legislative branch. Councillor Nolan noted that she would love for the City Council to have the same power and authority as the School Committee has relative to the budget. Chair Born responded noting that there was an entire meeting devoted to the budget. Director Ward also responded noting that the Committee did talk about City Council authority over the budget and the nuances between the City Manager and the City Council and the current challenges. The Charter Review Team did note that a recurring theme in the public testimony and amongst committee members is the feeling that the budget is a bit of a mystery process, and a better informed and more involved public would be seen as adding a democratic feature to the budget system. Councillor Nolan also asked about having At-Large Councillors versus Ward or District Councillors or having a combination. Councillor Nolan also asked about the implications of having a longer term and a large student population. The Charter Review Team noted that these matters are being discussed and they have had a presentation from the Elections Commission.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor Toner for comments and questions.**

Councillor Toner stated that it is his hope that through this process we do no harm and that as we go forward, we try to make sure that we keep the best of what we have in our form of government and do some cleaning up. Councillor Toner noted that he thinks having a City Manager and an elected City Council that hires and fires the City Manager is best, noting that this is where the Council's authority comes from. Councillor Toner also noted that at one time he thought District Councillors would be better, but he has changed his position in favor of At-Large Councillors as it requires a city wide view versus just focusing on one neighborhood. Councillor Toner asked about the timeline as he could not read that part of the materials, and if the recommendations would come one at a time or as a package. Chair Born responded noting that the report details the need to request an extension until the end of December, 2023. Anna Corning responded that it will be up to the Committee as to how they choose to present their recommendations.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Marie Saccoccio, Cambridge, MA who provided public comment and asked that the City Council grant the extension being requested.**

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Azeem who made a motion to close public comment.**

**City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.**

Councillor Burhan Azeem - Yes

Councillor Dennis J. Carlone – Yes

Vice Mayor Alanna M. Mallon – Yes

Councillor Marc C. McGovern – Yes  
 Councillor Patricia Nolan – Yes  
 Councillor E. Denise Simmons – Absent  
 Councillor Paul Toner – Yes  
 Councillor Quinton Y. Zondervan – No  
 Mayor Sumbul Siddiqui – Yes  
**Yes-7, No-1, Absent-1. Motion Passed.**

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor Carlone for comments and questions.**

Councillor Carlone responded to the comment made during public comment regarding elected officials serving on the Charter Review Committee. Councillor Carlone stressed that no current elected officials are on the Committee and there is only one former elected official on it. Councillor Carlone asked Chair Born about the Mayor/Manager memo, looking at accreditation of relationships and noted that what he has noticed is that so much depends on who the Manager is and the direction the Manager provides to staff. Councillor Carlone stressed the importance of Councillors having access to the experts. Councillor Carlone also raised the issue of having a Planning Board that is elected versus one that is not. Councillor Carlone noted that who are in the various positions, City Manager and Councillors, make the biggest difference but that it is important to have a structure in place that is clearer. Councillor Carlone stated that with the new City Manager, communication is much more regular.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor Azeem for comments and questions.**

**Councillor Azeem noted how excited he was about this meeting.** Councillor Azeem noted that he sees democracy through a particular lens noting the difference in the number of individuals who vote in a gubernatorial election versus a municipal election. Councillor Azeem asked how to get those who do not vote in municipal elections more involved and specifically about having even municipal elections in even years, along with non-municipal elections. Chair Born thanked Councillor Azeem for the questions and acknowledged that the Committee had received his letter about this. Chair Born noted that the Committee is cataloguing all the written correspondence it has received and it is on the website. Chair Born deferred to Director Ward who noted that he was not an election expert, but they have been doing research on this issue. Director Ward noted that they have been looking at whether a vote for a charter change could take place on the same day as state and federal elections in November 2024 and the answer is yes. Director Ward noted that with a Special Act, this could be done, however it would have to be done on a separate, physical ballot because you cannot put a charter question on a state and federal ballot. Director Ward noted that the same concern is applicable to regular municipal elections on an even numbered year, further noting that the Secretary of State's Office which oversees managing election law would not be particularly open to the idea of having a single ballot with state, federal and municipal questions on it. Director Ward noted that they might be open to it if there were separate ballots but that creates operational and logistical challenges. It was also noted that because Cambridge elects based on proportional representation there would also need to be different software and equipment at each polling place and current locations might not be large enough to run two separate operations. It was noted that this would be even further complicated

if the City had different voting eligibility requirements than did the state or federal government. Councillor Azeem thanked everyone for their good work and encouraged their continued efforts to increase involvement in local government. Councillor Azeem asked if consideration was being given to adding a solicitor to the list of City Council employees. Councillor Azeem also asked about the role of the Mayor, as the President of the City Council, noting that Councillors often have different views and asking if a City Council President has more power around how policy orders are managed, noting that in Boston, the City Council President has more power than the other Councillors. Councillor Azeem also noted his support for longer terms.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Vice Mayor Mallon for comments and questions.**

Vice Mayor Mallon thanked Chair Born and the rest of the members for their work, especially since there is no roadmap guiding them on how to do this. Vice Mayor Mallon stated that an extension of time seems necessary and critical to the work the Committee has been charged with. Vice Mayor Mallon asked how the Committee is receiving input from the public. Chair Born noted that there are several ways that the Committee has sought public input including offering an opportunity for public comment at every meeting. It was also noted that the Committee accepts written comments by email and that there have been meetings with several community groups and neighborhood groups throughout the City. Chair Born noted that the Committee has also hosted two public forums; one that was in person and another that was virtual. Chair Born noted that going forward there will be a series of public forums that are more topic specific and there will be specific surveys as the Committee gets closer to knowing what the specific questions will be. Vice Mayor Mallon noted that she hopes there will be a much larger reach with an online survey to reach the broader public including those who do not typically come forward to offer input on matters. Vice Mayor Mallon noted that she is interested in understanding what the public wants relative to Ward/District Councillors versus At-Large Councillors, or a combination of both. Vice Mayor Mallon also asked what the road map looks like between now and December 31, 2023. Chair Born noted that Committee Member Max Clermont joined the meeting. Chair Born responded to Vice Mayor Mallon noting that she and the Committee are acutely aware of the need for public input and turned it over to Project Manager Anna Corning to review the timeline. Project Manager Corning reviewed the timeline that was included in the report and indicated that she would send out an Excel document that was easier to read. Vice Mayor Mallon again talked about the importance of public input and noted the effectiveness of using Co-Organize related to the process for hiring a new City Manager.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor McGovern for comments and questions.**

Councillor McGovern noted he believes in the dedication of the Committee to getting a rich set of diverse voices from across the City and agrees with Vice Mayor Mallon's comments related to the need for additional outreach. Councillor McGovern noted the challenges involved in getting people to participate on this topic and suggested using the Community Engagement Team from the Department of Human Services that has deep connections with various folks with diverse backgrounds. Councillor McGovern said if in the end, 90% of the people who are commenting look like him, we have failed.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor Zondervan.** Councillor Zondervan noted that he is torn on the question of an extension because granting an extension would mean that Charter Reform would not be on the ballot this year. Director Ward responded noting that back in the fall the Committee tentatively decided to recommend moving beyond the old Plan E text which has been around since the 1940's and that it would be very hard to do this within the original time frame. Councillor Zondervan noted that it would be helpful to get at least some changes within the original timeline.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor Nolan.** Councillor Nolan spoke about the matter of timing, noting that she wished this had been more thoroughly thought through at the beginning of the process. Councillor Nolan noted there are many important issues that need to be fully addressed and additional time is needed. Councillor Nolan talked about the intent of voters related to "Boards and Commissions" was that it also includes multi member groups but that is not how it is being interpreted. Councillor Nolan also noted that some City Councils have the authority to approve or disapprove Department Heads and others in City Government, not just the City Manager and it is her hope that the Committee considers this especially regarding the City Solicitor and the Deputy City Manager.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Vice Mayor Mallon.** Vice Mayor Mallon said that she wants to be mindful that these are volunteers who signed up for a one year commitment and now they are graciously saying that they will do this for another seven or eight months. Vice Mayor Mallon said she is not disappointed with the timeline being extended because this has been a very thoughtful process and she believes we are right where we need to be.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui noted that she had provided feedback to the Charter Review Committee last week.** Mayor Siddiqui reiterated that longer terms are of interest and that she agrees that we need to elicit as much public comment as possible. Mayor Siddiqui noted that the members of the Charter Review Committee are well qualified and diverse with each coming from different perspectives and having different expertise. Mayor Siddiqui also noted that those serving on the Committee are not individuals whose names the Council always sees and there is power in their representation. Mayor Siddiqui noted that serving as the Chair of the School Committee is a big commitment and in other cities where there is a strong Mayor, the Mayor is not always the Chair of the School Committee. Mayor Siddiqui asked if there were an elected Mayor, what else would we want them to be doing? Mayor Siddiqui noted the positions that the School Committee currently has authority over and the positions that the City Council currently has authority over. Mayor Siddiqui noted that it is the task of the Committee to tell the City Council what they think on these issues and then go from there. The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui asked Solicitor Glowa if the Council could vote to approve an extension of time at this Special Meeting and Solicitor Glowa responded that the answer is "yes." Solicitor Glowa recommended language for the motion to grant the extension.

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor Nolan who made a motion that the City Council authorize an extension of time for the Special Committee/Charter Review Committee to file its report on suggested Charter changes with the City Council until December 31, 2023.**

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor Zondervan who exercised his Charter Right.**

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor Nolan who made a motion to accept the Committee Report filed by Chair Kathleen Born on behalf of the Charter Review Committee (included fourteen sets of minutes). Copy attached.**

**City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.**

Councillor Burhan Azeem - Yes  
 Councillor Dennis J. Carlone – Yes  
 Vice Mayor Alanna M. Mallon – Yes  
 Councillor Marc C. McGovern – Yes  
 Councillor Patricia Nolan – Yes  
 Councillor E. Denise Simmons – Absent  
 Councillor Paul Toner – Yes  
 Councillor Quinton Y. Zondervan – Yes  
 Mayor Sumbul Siddiqui – Yes

**Yes-8, Absent-1. Motion Passed.**

**The Chair, Mayor Siddiqui recognized Councillor Nolan who made a motion to adjourn. City Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.**

Councillor Burhan Azeem - Yes  
 Councillor Dennis J. Carlone – Yes  
 Vice Mayor Alanna M. Mallon – Yes  
 Councillor Marc C. McGovern – Yes  
 Councillor Patricia Nolan – Yes  
 Councillor E. Denise Simmons – Absent  
 Councillor Paul Toner – Yes  
 Councillor Quinton Y. Zondervan – Yes  
 Mayor Sumbul Siddiqui – Yes

**Yes-8, Absent-1. Motion Passed.**

The Cambridge City Council adjourned at approximately 4:50 p.m.

**Attachments:**

**Committee Report/Documents Submitted by Chair Born to the City Council on behalf of the Charter Review Committee.**

**Clerk’s Note:** The City of Cambridge/22 City View records every City Council meeting and every City Council Committee meeting. This is a permanent record. The video for this meeting can be viewed at:

[https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/468?view\\_id=1&redirect=true&h=27600a447c364a2c46f6a6d599344718](https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/468?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=27600a447c364a2c46f6a6d599344718).

Mayor Sumbul Siddiqui  
Vice Mayor Alanna M. Mallon  
Councillor Burhan Azeem  
Councillor Dennis J. Carlone  
Councillor Marc C. McGovern  
Councillor Patricia M. Nolan  
Councillor E. Denise Simmons  
Councillor Paul F. Toner  
Councillor Quinton Y. Zondervan

March 20, 2023

Dear Mayor Siddiqui and Councillors,

You have charged the Charter Review Committee with an important and daunting task. The responsibility of reviewing our City's governing document is something our Committee does not take lightly. We are committed to a thorough, methodical, transparent, and publicly inclusive evaluation of the existing Cambridge City Charter.

Members of our Committee often remark, in one way or another, that our task is at once impossible and essential. We understand that to recommend changes to a working document that has not been thoroughly reviewed in eighty years, to recommend any changes to a form of government which is an essential part of the culture of our city, will take time and careful deliberation. Throughout this process, we have dealt with the odd feeling of simultaneously moving too slowly and too quickly.

It should be noted that, by your design, we are not a committee of experts; we are a committee of ordinary community members, individually and collectively focused on exploring how the government of Cambridge can most fairly and equitably serve its citizens.

Justice and democracy are two words that come up repeatedly in our discussions. As we have indicated in our adopted committee value statement: "This Cambridge Charter Review Committee strives to work effectively and efficiently to produce a recommendation that empowers equitable, just, and democratic opportunities for all individuals who make up our community."

Attached please find the minutes of our fourteen Charter Review Committee meetings to date, along with a report on the Committee's staff, budget, and schedule to date as well as that proposed going forward. Attached, we have provided a brief outline of a working plan for the rest of 2023. We respectfully request a six-month extension to deliver our report to the City Council on December 31, 2023.

Sincerely,  
Kathleen Born, Chair  
On Behalf of the Cambridge Charter Review Committee

Date: March 20, 2023

To: Cambridge City Council

From: Kathleen L. Born, Chair, Cambridge Charter Review Committee

Re: Interim Report on the Ongoing Work of the Charter Review Committee

**Background:**

In November 2021, Cambridge voters approved several amendments to the Cambridge City Charter, including the following section which became effective on January 1, 2022:

*Section 116(b). Not later than July 1, in each year ending in a 2, the City Council shall provide for a review to be made of the city charter by a special committee to be established by ordinance. All members of the special committee shall be voters of the city not holding elective office. The special committee shall file a report with the City Council within 1 year of its appointment recommending any changes to the city charter which it deems necessary or desirable, unless an extension is authorized by vote of the City Council. Action on any proposed charter changes shall be as authorized by the Massachusetts constitution or general laws.*

On July 1, 2022 the City Council appointed the following fifteen Cambridge residents to serve on the Cambridge Charter Review Committee:

*Kaleb Abebe*

*Jessica Dejesus Acevedo*

*Mosammat Faria Afreen*

*Kathleen Born (subsequently appointed as Chair)*

*Nikolas Bowie*

*Kevin Chen*

*Max Clermont*

*Jennifer Gilbert*

*Kai Long*

*Patrick Magee*

*Mina Makarious*

*Lisa Peterson*

*Ellen Shachter*

*Susan Shell*

*Jim Stockard*

**Background (Continued):**

The Charter Review Committee is a Special Committee of the City Council but no City Council members are members of this Committee.

Charter Review Committee members do not receive stipends or reimbursements. The Committee Members have not been sworn in by the City Clerk. There is no fixed term for the Committee Members. The Committee may be dissolved at the acceptance of its Final Report to the City Council, or the City Council may act to define a date of expiration or to extend the appointments

All regular meetings of the Committee have, to this date, been conducted remotely on Zoom. At this date, it is uncertain whether Zoom meetings of the Charter Review Committee will continue, after the expiration of the Governors' Emergency Orders, to be permitted under the Open Meeting Law.

**Staff and Budget**

The Collins Center from UMass Boston was contracted through the office of the Mayor from August 2022 to provide consulting services through June 2023.

When the Charter Review Committee was appointed by the City Council, Patrick Hayes, Aide to Councillor Patricia Nolan, and Michael Scarlett, Chief of Staff to Mayor Sumbul Siddiqui were assigned to provide supporting services to the Committee as needed.

The first meeting of the Charter Review Committee was held August 16, 2022. It quickly became apparent that additional dedicated staff would be necessary to meet the operational needs of the Committee (for example the scheduling of the meetings, communications with Committee members, providing public notices of the meetings).

Contributing to the need for additional staff was the Committee's firm resolve, dating from its earliest meetings, to make as broad a community outreach effort as possible. It became immediately apparent that some kind of dedicated online presence was going to be necessary to meet public expectations as well as to serve as a resource for the members of the Committee. Without designated funding for an outside web service, Cambridge's IT department agreed to provide a city webpage. This site requires continuous staff maintenance and update in order to meet the Committee's needs for information and the similar expectations of the public.

Other ongoing outreach efforts include, but are not limited to, soliciting and organizing input from the general public and from important community leaders, including past appointed and elected officials. All of this requires professional staff time to organize and execute.

Anna Corning, who held a similar staff position to the Somerville Charter Review Committee was recommended by the Collins Center. She was interviewed and hired by the City of Cambridge in a part time capacity in mid-October.

**Staff and Budget (Continued)**

The very capable current team of Anna Corning, Patrick Hayes, and Michael Scarlett (as needed) appears to be adequate, cooperative, congenial, and well-suited for the Charter Review effort, given its current scope. However, if the City Council suggests that a greater level of public input is merited, the Committee may request added staff and funds to cover expenses. There is also the possibility of requesting mediation or dispute resolution services should that be necessary to bring the Committee to agreement at the conclusion of their work.

The Charter Review Committee requested an allocation for miscellaneous expenses associated with public outreach. On March 6, 2023 a budget allocation of \$40,000 was approved by the City Council.

**Record Keeping and Open Meeting Law Compliance**

Staff from the Cambridge City Clerk's office, typically Nicole Erwin, Clerk of Committees, provide support for all Charter Review Committee and Sub-Committee meetings, providing meeting notes and other records. At the earliest meetings, before Ms. Erwin had joined the Clerk's staff, recording of minutes was provided by Naomie Stephen of the City Council Office.

The Charter Review Committee is considered to be a Special Committee of the Cambridge City Council, subject to the Massachusetts Open Meeting Law (OML), including (but not limited to) quorum requirements, record-keeping requirements, and public notice of any meetings which involve a quorum of the Committee or sub-Committees. The City Law Department provides ongoing advice to the Committee regarding general OML matters. Law Department staff attend the regular meetings of the Committee.

## **Minutes of the Charter Review Committee and its Planning Sub-Committee**

See the attached PDF for all meeting minutes approved by the Charter Review Committee to date.

### **Charter Review Committee Meeting Dates (Sub-Committee dates as noted) Major Topics of Discussion, Actions Taken**

August 16, 2022

Member Introductions

Introduction of Collins Center Staff and Description of their Role and Experience

Briefing on Open Meeting Law

September 13, 2022

Presentation by Collins Center Staff

Roberts Rules

Questions from Committee Members

Public Comment

September 29, 2022

Discussion about forming sub-committees to work on agenda-setting and drafting

Collins Center staff on their role in agenda setting

Public Comment

October 25, 2022

Public Comment

Collins Center led discussion on “things that are working well in Cambridge and things that are not.”

Motion to form a Planning Sub-Committee passed unanimously

November 8, 2022

Discussion on major themes drawn by Collins Center from previous meetings

Discussion of a “Values Statement”

Public Comment on major themes

November 22, 2022

Committee “Decision Making Proposal” adopted

Community Engagement Plan

Public Comment

December 6, 2022

Value Statement adopted

Review of Current Cambridge Charter Plan E and Exemplar Modern Charter

Vote to Rewrite Charter

Public Comment

**Charter Review Committee Meeting Dates (Sub-Committee dates as noted) Major Topics of Discussion, Actions Taken**

December 13, 2022 (Planning Sub-Committee)

Discussion of Agendas for upcoming Committee Meetings and for Public Outreach Meetings

December 20, 2022

Community Engagement Plan

Discussion about: What is working about the city council / manager form of government? What are the challenges about the city council / manager form of government? Should the city form of government stay the same or change?

Public Comment

January 3, 2023

Planning for Panel of Current and Past distinguished Massachusetts Mayors and City Managers

Additional Planning for Community Engagement

Presentation by Collins Center of “Example Baseline Cambridge Charter in Modern Format”

Public Comment

January 17, 2023

Update on Community Engagement Efforts

Presentation from City of Cambridge Current Finance and Budget Team on the current process for setting the city budget. Q&A from Committee Members

Collins Center Memo regarding budget articles in charters. Discussion of options.

Public Comment

January 27, 2023 (Planning Sub-Committee)

Discussion on Committee Work Plan and Timeline

January 31, 2023

Public Comment

Review Collins Center Memo on Sample Charter Finance Article Language from other Massachusetts cities and town

Presentation from Cambridge Election Commission and discussion

February 7, 2023

Public Comment

Discussion of possible revisions to election format, timing

Discussion of Manager vs. Mayor: How has your perspective shifted as a result of the information and presentations from the last several meetings? What questions and information do you still need to form a decision?

**Charter Review Committee Meeting Dates (Sub-Committee dates as noted) Major Topics of Discussion, Actions Taken**

February 28, 2023

Public Comment

Chief Executives Panel with remarks by:

Alex Morse current Manager of Provincetown and former Mayor of Holyoke,

Joe Curtatone former Mayor of Somerville,

Eileen Donoghue former Manager and Mayor of Lowell and former State Senator

Q&A with Panelists from Committee Members

Discussion of Committee Timeline

March 14, 2023

Public Comment

Review and Adoption of Amended Project Timeline

Discussion and Q&A with City Manager Yi-An Huang

## Summary of Significant Actions to Date

### Committee Ground Rules, adopted on November 22, 2022

*The committee agrees to the following ground rules that all members will adhere to in deliberation and throughout the review process.*

#### *Members will:*

*Hear all voices; treat one another and our ideas with respect.*

*Take Space, Make Space. Make space for others to speak and feel comfortable taking up more space if you have not been.*

*Maintain an open mind, remain learning-focused and flexible to consider other opinions.*

*Assume good intentions of all committee members and the public.*

*Collaborate as we work together and continue to build trust.*

*Work efficiently to build a thoughtful and deliberate review process.*

*Acknowledge each individual has knowledge, strategies, and comments to contribute.*

*Respectfully question assumptions and take the opportunity when possible to ask: "Is there any data we might bring in to better inform our decision around this topic?"*

*To ensure committee members are prepared and able to fully contribute in each meeting the following will be implemented: each meeting and/or agenda item will have defined facilitator(s), parameters and goal, before a vote the issue will be restated clearly and members will have an opportunity to comment or ask questions.*

*Committee members should email [cambridgecharterreview@cambridgema.gov](mailto:cambridgecharterreview@cambridgema.gov) if they cannot attend a meeting, need to leave early or have a schedule conflict.*

*All communications, whenever possible, should CC [cambridgecharterreview@cambridgema.gov](mailto:cambridgecharterreview@cambridgema.gov), for organizational purposes.*

*Committee members should feel comfortable discussing their charter review work with the public and members of the press as individual members of the committee, as the goal is to engage with as many stakeholders as possible.*

## Summary of Actions to Date (continued)

### **Fist to Five Consensus Decision Tool adopted on November 22, 2022 (later determined by City Clerk to be impermissible with OML)**

**The committee agreed to use the fist to five voting method to gather a sense of the committee during deliberations and to gauge consensus.**

**Five:** I love this and will champion it!

**Four:** I'm good with this as is.

**Three:** I see minor issues we can resolve later.

**Two:** I see minor issues we need to resolve now.

**One:** I see major issues we need to resolve now.

**Fist:** No way, I will block this.

### **Community Values Statement adopted on December 6, 2022**

***This Cambridge Charter Review Committee strives to work effectively and efficiently to produce a recommendation that empowers equitable, just, and democratic opportunities for all individuals who make up our community.***

***Civility*** We will hold all committee members with equal decision making capabilities and acknowledge the dignity and humanity of the entire community. We will engage each other and the public with respect, tolerance, humility, and open-mindedness throughout the process.

***Community*** We will engage a cross section of the community, focusing on historically marginalized groups, to incorporate interests of people of all income levels who work, live, pray, and learn in Cambridge to ensure an equitable charter. We will seek participation and feedback from residents, community organizations, youth, workers, businesses and other stakeholders in both virtual and in-person spaces and use engagement methods most accessible to them.

***Social Justice*** We will strive to improve Cambridge's Charter by addressing the historical inequities built into the government foundation and power structures, acknowledging that Cambridge was built on land stolen from Indigenous people and built and financed by brutal slavery. We will strive to make the committee's work, communications, and deliberations transparent and available to the public.

**Summary of Actions to Date (continued)****A New Charter (not an Edited Charter) is Necessary  
Informally agreed upon on December 6, 2022**

The Charter Review Committee agreed that the existing text and format of the Cambridge City Charter needs replacement and not editing. The Collins Center provided samples of contemporary Model Charters as well as an entirely re-written Cambridge Charter that substituted gender neutral language, contemporary idioms, modern titles, and re-organized the chapters into logical topic sections. The Committee decided that drafting new text using contemporary language and a clear structure would be our goal, regardless of whether the changes were minor or major in scope.

**Summary of Actions to Date (continued)****Public Outreach Events**

Public Meeting at Main Cambridge Library, January 24, 2023

Zoom Public Meeting, February 4, 2023

Democratic Socialists of America, January 11, 2023

Harvard Square Business Association, February 3, 2023

Porter Square Neighbors Association, February 16, 2023

Cambridge Housing Authority Tenants' Union Leaders, February 21, 2023

East Cambridge Planning Team, February 22, 2023

Cambridgeport Neighborhood Association, February 28, 2023

A Better Cambridge, March 2, 2023

Cambridge City Democratic Committee, March 9, 2023

Cambridge School Committee Round Table, March 14, 2023

**Upcoming Events**

Cambridge Wards 1 and 2, March 23, 2023

Public Forum, April

Public Forum, June

Public Forum, August

Public Forum, September

Public Forum, November

**Interviews with Past and Present Public Officials**

Yi-An Huang

Robert Healy

Louis A. DePasquale

Richard Rossi

David P. Maher

Henrietta Davis

David Sullivan

Jivan Sobrinho-Wheeler

Arthur Goldberg

Jeffrey Young

**Pending**

Anthony Galluccio (scheduled)

Michael Sullivan

Ken Reeves (still seeking contact info)

**Summary of Actions to Date (continued)****Proposed Committee Timeline adopted on March 14, 2023**

The Charter Review Committee designed and agreed on a proposed timeline to include topic specific committee meetings, committee hosted public forums, and meetings to review draft charter text. The adopted timeline would target the committee work to be complete by the end of December 2023.

Please see attached timeline for details.

# **Charter Review Commi Report to City Council**

Cambridge Charter Review Committee  
March 22, 2023

# Overview

## **Charge of the Committee:**

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee has been convened by *Council* to comprehensively review *the City's current charter* and to *recommend changes* to ensure that Cambridge's government meets the needs of our residents and is responsive to the challenges of today and beyond.

## **Current Stage:**

Understanding policy trends, data analysis, other municipality comparisons, engaging with community groups, public input and hearing from former current city employees and elected officials.

# Committee Meetings and Actions

The committee has met biweekly since August 2022

## **Initial Meetings:**

Establishing rules and procedures, guiding priorities for committee work, developing an understanding of the history of Cambridge's charter and in general.

## **Current Stage:**

Understanding policy trends, data analysis, other municipality comparison, engaging with community groups, public input and hearing from former current city employees and elected officials.

Last several meetings focus on form of government – hearing from many city managers of other municipalities and current city manager and elected officials

# Committee Meetings and Actions

## **Actions**

- Adopted Committee ground rules
- Adopted Consensus building tool
- Adopted Committee Values Statement
- Recommend to draft new text for charter, regardless of changes to
- Adopted Proposed timeline for committee work

# Committee Priorities

## **Value Statement:**

- This Cambridge Charter Review Committee strives to work effectively and efficiently to produce a recommendation that empowers just, and democratic opportunities for all individuals who make up our community.

## **Priorities for process and recommendations:**

- Enfranchising/Equity
- Participation/Accessibility
- Effectiveness of Government/Collaboration with other entities
- Responsiveness/accountability/transparency
- Legislative functioning/balance of power between legislative and executive branches
- Vision/values/principles

# What is included in a Charter?

Charters define the basic foundational structures and powers of a city or town, such as:

- Form of Government (manager, mayor, town meeting, etc)
- Term lengths and/or limits for elected officials
- City Council & School Committee Composition (number of members, at-large vs district representation)
- If roles throughout the city are appointed or elected
- Appointment and confirm process for department heads boards and commissions
- Roles in creation and approval budget
- Election system and requirements
- Administrative organization
- Public Participation Mechanisms

# Charter Review Committee Contact Information

Website: [www.cambridgema.gov/charterreview](http://www.cambridgema.gov/charterreview)

Email: [charterreviewcommittee@cambridgema.gov](mailto:charterreviewcommittee@cambridgema.gov)

Virtual Public Committee Meetings Every other Tuesday at 5

We take public comment at the beginning of every meeting and  
comments by email.

## **Appendix Contents**

|   |       |
|---|-------|
| Appendix A - Charter Review Committee Proposed Timeline | pg. 1 |
| Appendix B - Cambridge Plan E Charter                   | pg. 2 |
| Appendix C - Charter Review Committee Approved Minutes  | pg. 9 |



## Plan E Charter\*

\*Please note that the full text of the Cambridge Plan E Charter, as amended by three amendments effective January 1, 2022 (one added a paragraph to Section 105, and the two others added two subsections to Section 116), appears in its entirety below. It exists without the three amendments of January 1, 2022 within separate sections of The Commonwealth of Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 43, beginning with Section 93 and continuing in separate listings. See link immediately below:

<http://www.malegislature.gov/Laws/GeneralLaws/PartI/TitleVII/Chapter43>

### **PLAN E: Government by a city council including a mayor elected from its number, and a city manager, with all elected bodies elected at large by proportional representation (from Chapter 43 of the Massachusetts General Laws)**

*Chapter 43:  
Section 93. Plan E; effective upon adoption*      **Section 93.** The method of city government provided for in the following twenty-three sections shall be known as Plan E. Upon the adoption by a city of Plan E, it shall become operative as provided in sections one to forty-five, inclusive, except as otherwise provided by the following sections.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 94.  
Definitions*      **Section 94.** The terms “city clerk” and “registrars of voters” when used in sections ninety-three to one hundred and sixteen, inclusive, shall have the respective meanings given them by section one of chapter fifty.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 95.  
Governing power of city council, etc.*      **Section 95.** The government of the city and the general management and control of all its affairs shall, except as otherwise provided in this chapter, be vested in a city council, which shall exercise its powers in the manner hereinafter set forth, but subject to sections one to forty-five, inclusive, insofar as not inconsistent; except that the city manager shall have the authority hereinafter specified, that the general management and conduct of the public schools of the city and of the property pertaining thereto shall be vested in the school committee, and that the city clerk, the city auditor, any official of the city appointed by the governor and any trustees or other officers whose election by the voters of the city is required by reason of the fact that the city has accepted any gift, devise or bequest shall have the powers and duties which may be conferred and imposed upon them by law.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 96. City council; membership; tenure*      **Section 96.** The city council shall consist of seven or nine members, as provided in this section, all of whom shall, at each regular municipal election, be elected at large for terms of two years each by proportional representation as hereinafter provided and shall serve until their successors are qualified. The city council in any city having seven wards or less at the time of adoption of this plan shall be composed of seven members and the city council in any city having more than seven wards at the time of adoption thereof, nine members. Section eight of chapter thirty-nine shall apply to members of the city council. All trustees or other officers mentioned in section ninety-five shall at each regular municipal election be elected at large for terms of two years each by [proportional representation](#) as hereinafter provided.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 97. City council; powers and duties; organization*      **Section 97.** The city council shall have and exercise all the legislative powers of the city, except as such powers are reserved by this chapter to the school committee and to the qualified voters of the city.

The city council, elected as aforesaid, shall meet at ten o’clock in the forenoon of the first Monday of January following the regular municipal election, and the members of the city council shall severally make oath, before the city clerk or a justice of the peace, to perform faithfully the duties of their respective offices, except that any member-elect not present shall so make oath at the first regular meeting of the city council thereafter which he attends. For the purposes of organization, the city clerk shall be temporary chairman until the mayor or vice-chairman has qualified.

Thereupon the city council shall, by a majority vote of all the members elected, elect a mayor and a vice-chairman from its own members and the persons elected as such shall likewise make oath to perform faithfully the duties of the respective offices to which they are so elected, and they may so make oath at the same meeting at which they are so elected. The organization of the city council shall take place as aforesaid, notwithstanding the absence, death, refusal to serve or non-election of one or more of the members; provided, that a majority of all the members elected to the city council are present and have qualified. If the office of mayor or vice-chairman becomes vacant, the city council shall in like manner elect one of its members to fill such office for the unexpired term; provided, that no such vacancy shall be filled so long as there is any vacancy in the council.

Chapter 43:  
Section 98.  
Meetings of city  
council

**Section 98.** The city council shall fix suitable times for its regular meetings. The mayor, or the vice-chairman of the city council, or any four members thereof, or any three members thereof in the case of a city council composed of seven members, may at any time call a special meeting by causing written notices, stating the time of holding such meeting and signed by the person or persons calling the same, to be delivered in hand to each member of the city council, or left at his usual dwelling place, at least twelve hours before the time of such meeting. Meetings of the city council may also be held at any time when all the members of the city council are present and consent thereto. Except in the cases of executive sessions authorized by section twenty-three A of chapter thirty-nine, all meetings of the city council shall be open to the press and to the public, and the rules of the city council shall provide that citizens and employees of the city shall have a reasonable opportunity to be heard at any such meeting in regard to any matter considered thereat.

Chapter 43:  
Section 99.  
Quorum;  
presiding officer;  
duties of city  
clerk; voting  
procedure

**Section 99.** A majority of all the members elected to the city council shall constitute a quorum. The mayor, if present, shall preside at the meetings and may vote. In the absence of the mayor, the vice-chairman of the city council shall preside and, in the absence of both, a temporary chairman shall be chosen, who shall serve during the absence of both the mayor and the vice-chairman. The city clerk shall be, ex-officio, clerk of the city council, and shall keep records of its proceedings; but, in case of his absence or disability or of a vacancy in the office, the city council shall elect a temporary clerk, who shall be sworn to the faithful discharge of his duties and shall act as clerk of the city council until the city clerk resumes his duties or a new city clerk is qualified. All final votes of the city council on questions involving the expenditure of fifty dollars or more, or upon the request of any member any vote of the city council, shall be by yeas and nays and shall be entered on the records. The affirmative vote of a majority of all the members elected to the city council shall be necessary for the passage of any order, ordinance, resolution or vote, except that the affirmative vote of a majority of the members present shall be sufficient to adjourn any meeting of the city council.

Chapter 43:  
Section 100.  
Mayor; official  
head of city;  
powers and  
duties; vice-  
chairman

**Section 100.** The mayor shall be recognized as the official head of the city for all ceremonial purposes and shall be recognized by the courts for the purpose of serving civil process and by the governor for military purposes. In time of public danger or emergency, as determined by the city council, he may, with its consent, take command of the police, maintain order and enforce the laws; and he shall have all the authority and powers conferred upon mayors by sections eighteen and nineteen of chapter thirty-three. He shall be chairman of the city council and chairman of the school committee. He shall have no power to veto but shall have the same powers as any other member of either such body to vote upon all measures coming before it. He shall perform such other duties consistent with his office and with sections ninety-three to one hundred and sixteen, inclusive, as may be imposed upon him by the city council. During the absence or disability of the mayor, or during the time such office is vacant, his duties shall be performed by the vice-chairman. In case, at any time, there shall be neither a mayor nor a vice-chairman, the member of the council senior in length of service, or, if more than one have so served, then the member senior both in age and length of service shall perform the duties of mayor until a new mayor has qualified. The mayor shall have no power of appointment, except of the employees mentioned in section twenty-five and except as provided in section one hundred and two.

Chapter 43:  
Section 101.  
Repealed, 1952,  
259, Sec. 3

Chapter 43:  
Section 102.  
Vacancies in  
elective bodies

**Section 102.** Except as provided in this section, a vacancy in any elective body shall be filled in the manner provided in section thirteen of chapter fifty-four A. If, under said section, no regularly nominated candidate of the city council or school committee remains, the vacancy shall be filled for the unexpired term by a majority vote of the remaining members, except that if the remaining members fail to fill such vacancy within thirty days after they shall have been notified by the city clerk that such vacancy exists, such vacancy shall be filled by the appointment of any qualified voter of the city by the mayor, or, if there is no mayor, by the vice-chairman, or if there is no mayor or vice-chairman, by the member of the council or of the school committee, as the case may be, senior in length of service, or, if more than one have so served, then the member senior both in age and length of service.

*Chapter 43:*        **Section 103.** The city council shall appoint a city manager who shall be sworn to the faithful  
*Section 103. City* performance of his duties and who shall be the chief administrative officer of the city and shall be  
*manager;* responsible for the administration of all departments, commissions, boards and officers of the city,  
*appointment;* whether established before its adoption of this plan or thereafter, except that of the city clerk, city  
*qualifications;* auditor, any official appointed by the governor or any body elected by the voters of the city. He  
*compensation;* shall be appointed on the basis of his administrative and executive qualifications only, and need not  
*removal* be a resident of the city or commonwealth when appointed. He shall hold office during the pleasure  
of the city council and shall receive such compensation as it shall fix by ordinance. No member of  
the city council shall during his term of office be chosen as city manager, and no person who has  
within two years been elected to or served in any elective office in the city or in the county in  
which the city is located shall be chosen as city manager.

Before the city manager may be removed, if he so demand, he shall be given a written statement of  
the reasons alleged for his removal and shall have the right to be heard publicly thereon at a  
meeting of the city council prior to the final vote on the question of his removal, but pending and  
during such hearing the city council may suspend him from office. The action of the city council  
in suspending or removing the city manager shall be final, it being the intention of this provision to  
vest all authority and fix all responsibility for such suspension or removal in the city council. In  
case of the absence, disability or suspension of the city manager, the city council shall designate  
the head of some department to perform the duties of city manager during such absence, disability  
or suspension, and, in case the office of city manager becomes vacant, the city council shall  
designate the head of some department to serve as acting city manager until a new city manager is  
appointed.

*Chapter 43:*        **Section 104.** Except as otherwise specifically provided in this chapter, it shall be the duty of the  
*Section 104.* city manager to act as chief conservator of the peace within the city; to supervise the  
*Powers, rights* administration of the affairs of the city; to see that within the city the laws of the commonwealth  
*and duties of city* and the ordinances, resolutions and regulations of the city council are faithfully executed; and to  
*manager* make such recommendations to the city council concerning the affairs of the city as may to him  
seem desirable; to make reports to the city council from time to time upon the affairs of the city;  
and to keep the city council fully advised of the city's financial condition and its future needs. He  
shall prepare and submit to the city council budgets as required of the mayor by section thirty-two  
of chapter forty-four and, in connection therewith, may, to the extent provided by said section  
thirty-two in the case of a mayor, require the submission to him, by all departments, commissions,  
boards and offices of the city, of estimates of the amounts necessary for their expenses. He shall  
make all appointments and removals in the departments, commissions, boards and offices of the  
city for whose administration he is responsible, except as otherwise provided in this chapter, and  
shall perform such other duties as may be prescribed by this chapter or be required of him by  
ordinance or resolution of the city council. The city manager shall have and possess, and shall  
exercise, all the powers, rights and duties, other than legislative, had, possessed or exercised,  
immediately prior to the adoption of this plan, by the mayor, board of aldermen, common council  
and all other boards, commissions and committees of the city and their members, severally or  
collectively, except such as are by this chapter conferred upon the school committee or are  
otherwise provided for thereby.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 105. City  
officers and  
employees;  
appointments  
and removals*

**Section 105.** Such officers and employees as the city council, with the advice of the city manager, shall determine are necessary for the proper administration of the departments, commissions, boards and offices of the city for whose administration the city manager is responsible shall be appointed, and may be removed, by the city manager. The city manager shall report every appointment and removal made by him to the city council at the next meeting thereof following such appointment or removal. The city manager may authorize the head of a department, commission or board, or the holder of an office, for whose administration he is responsible, to appoint and remove subordinates in such department, commission, board or office. All appointments by, or under the authority of, the city manager, if subject to chapter thirty-one and the rules and regulations made under authority thereof, shall be made in accordance therewith, and all other appointments as aforesaid shall be on the basis of executive and administrative ability and training and experience in the work to be performed.

The City Manager shall refer to the City Council and simultaneously file with the Clerk the name of each person the City Manager desires to appoint or reappoint as a member of a board or commission. Appointment of a member of a board or commission made by the City Manager will be effective upon a majority vote of the city council, which vote shall occur within 60 days after the date on which notice of the proposed appointment was filed with the City Clerk. The appointment may be approved or rejected by a majority of the full City Council before 60 days. An appointment or reappointment shall take effect if the City Council fails to act within those 60 days.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 106.  
Officers and  
employees;  
regulations;  
penalty for  
violations*

**Section 106.** Officers and employees of the city appointed by, or under the authority of, the city manager shall perform the duties required of them by the city manager, under general regulations of the city council. Any violation of this section shall constitute sufficient grounds for removal of any such officer or employee.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 107.  
Interference with  
city manager by  
council  
forbidden;  
penalty*

**Section 107.** Neither the city council nor any of its committees or members shall direct or request the appointment of any person to, or his removal from, office by the city manager or any of his subordinates, or in any manner take part in the appointment or removal of officers and employees in that portion of the service of said city for whose administration the city manager is responsible. Except for the purpose of inquiry, the city council and its members shall deal with that portion of the service of the city as aforesaid solely through the city manager, and neither the city council nor any member thereof shall give orders to any subordinate of the city manager either publicly or privately. Any member of the city council who violates, or participates in the violation of, any provision of this section shall be punished by a fine of not more than five hundred dollars or by imprisonment for not more than six months, or both, and upon final conviction thereof his office in the city council shall thereby be vacated and he shall never again be eligible for any office or position, elective or otherwise, in the service of the city.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 108.  
Solicitation of  
political  
contributions by  
employees;  
penalties*

**Section 108.** No employee of any department, board or commission of the city shall, directly or indirectly, solicit or receive, or in any manner be concerned in soliciting or receiving any assessment, subscription or contribution for any political party, for any candidate for city office or for any political committee organized on behalf of such candidate. This section shall not prevent such persons from being members of political organizations or committees. The soliciting or receiving of any gift, payment, contribution, assessment, subscription or promise of money or other thing of value by a non-elected political committee organized to promote the candidacy for city office of an employee of any department, board or commission of the city shall not be deemed to be a direct or indirect solicitation or receipt of such contribution by such person, provided, however, that no such gift, payment, contribution, assessment, subscription or promise of money or other thing of value may be solicited or received on behalf of such a person from any person or combination of persons if such person so employed knows or has reason to know that the person or combination of persons has an interest in any particular matter in which the person so employed participates or has participated in the course of such employment or which is the subject of his official responsibility. A person who violates any provision of this section shall be punished by a fine of not more than five hundred dollars or by imprisonment for not more than six months, or both such fine and imprisonment, and upon final conviction thereof the office or position in the service of the city held by such person shall be vacated and such person shall not be eligible for an office or position, elective or otherwise, in the service of the city.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 109.  
Regular  
municipal  
election; date*

**Section 109.** The regular municipal election under this plan shall take place on the Tuesday next following the first Monday of November in every odd numbered year, and all members of the city council, the school committee and any board of trustees or other officers referred to in section ninety-five, and no others, shall be elected at each such election.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 110.  
Candidates;  
statement and  
petition*

**Section 110.** Any registered voter of the city who is eligible for election to any elective municipal body shall be entitled to have his name printed as a candidate therefor on the official ballot to be used at the regular municipal election; provided, that at least twenty-eight days prior to such election there shall be filed with the city clerk a statement in writing of his candidacy, signed by him, and with such statement the petition of not less than fifty nor more than one hundred registered voters of the city, whose signatures shall have been certified as required by law. Except as aforesaid, no person shall be entitled to have his name printed as a candidate on such ballot. Said statement and petition shall be in substantially the following form:

Statement of Candidate

I ( ), on oath declare that I reside at (number, if any) on (name of street) in the city of ; that I am a voter therein, qualified to vote for a candidate for the hereinafter mentioned office; that I am a candidate for the office of (name of office) to be voted for at the regular municipal election to be held on Tuesday, the day of , nineteen hundred and ; and I request that my name be printed as such candidate on the official ballot for use at said election.

(Signed) Commonwealth of  
Massachusetts

ss.

Subscribed and sworn to at ( ) on this day of , nineteen hundred and before me,

(Signed)

Justice of the Peace.

(or Notary Public).

Petition Accompanying Statement of Candidate

Whereas (name of candidate) is a candidate for the office of (state the office), we, the undersigned, voters of the city of , duly qualified to vote for a candidate for said office, do hereby request that the name of said (name of candidate) as a candidate for said office be printed on the official ballot to be used at the regular municipal election to be held on the Tuesday of , nineteen hundred and . The petition may be on one or more papers and need not be sworn to.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 111.  
Nomination  
papers*

**Section 111.** Any nomination papers filed under section one hundred and ten bearing more than the maximum number of signatures permitted thereby shall be invalid. No voter may sign the nomination papers of more than one candidate for election as a member of any elective municipal body; and if a voter signs nomination papers of more than one such candidate his signature shall be invalid on all such papers except the one first acted upon by the registrars of voters.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 112.  
Ballots; form  
and contents*

**Section 112.** There shall be a separate form of ballot for each body to be elected, and each such separate form of ballot shall be of a different and clearly distinguishable color from that of any other form of ballot prepared and furnished at the public expense for use at the same election. On such ballots for use in electing members of any elective body there shall be printed the following directions to voters, the first sentence under the heading to be printed in prominent bold faced type:

#### DIRECTIONS TO VOTERS

Do not use X marks.

Mark your choices with numbers only.

Put the figure 1 opposite your first choice; the figure 2 opposite your second choice; the figure 3 opposite your third choice; and so on. Mark as many choices as you please.

Do not put the same figure opposite more than one name.

If you spoil this ballot, tear it across once, return it to the election officer in charge of the ballots and get another from him.

No official ballot used at any regular municipal election shall have printed thereon any party or political designation or mark, and there shall not be appended to the name of any candidate any such party or political designation or mark, or anything showing how he was nominated or indicating his views or opinions.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 113.  
Preparing  
ballots, etc.;  
procedure*

**Section 113.** The provisions of sections five, six and seven of [chapter fifty-four A](#) and so much of section eight thereof as relates to the order of polling places by which ballots are to be counted shall apply with respect to municipal elections in a city adopting this plan.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 114.  
Counting of  
ballots;  
procedure*

**Section 114.** As soon as the polls have closed, the election officials at each polling place shall seal the ballot box without opening it, and in such manner that ballots cannot be removed therefrom or inserted therein without breaking the seal, and shall deliver such ballot box at once, as the city clerk may direct, to the central counting place, together with the voting lists, a record of the ballot box register, a record of the number of ballots given out, the ballots spoiled and returned, and the ballots not given out, all of which shall be enclosed in an envelope, and the election officials shall certify thereon as to the identity of the contents thereof. At the central counting place the ballot boxes shall be opened and the number of ballots found therein recorded and compared with the records sent from the polling places. Any discrepancies discovered shall be recorded and dealt with according to the principles laid down by the general election laws, so far as such principles may be applicable. The ballots for the city council shall be counted first and the ballots for the school committee shall be counted second. Ballots cast for other purposes than the election of members to elective bodies shall be counted at the central counting place in accordance with the laws otherwise applicable to the counting thereof. No information regarding the state of the balloting shall be disclosed before the close of the polls.

*Chapter 43:  
Section 115.  
Repealed, 1972,  
596, Sec. 1*

*Chapter 43:  
Section 116.  
General election  
laws;  
applicability*

**Section 116.** Except as otherwise provided in this chapter, all regular elections held under this plan shall be subject to all general laws relating to elections and corrupt practices, so far as applicable and not inconsistent with this chapter.

**Section 116(a).** Annually the City Council shall prepare and deliver to the City Manager a written review of the City Manager's performance in a manner provided by ordinance.

**Section 116(b).** Not later than July 1, in each year ending in a 2, the City Council shall provide for a review to be made of the city charter by a special committee to be established by ordinance. All members of the special committee shall be voters of the city not holding elective office. The special committee shall file a report with the City Council within 1 year of its appointment recommending any changes to the city charter which it deems necessary or desirable, unless an extension is authorized by vote of the City Council. Action on any proposed charter changes shall be as authorized by the Massachusetts constitution or general laws

# MINUTES OF THE CAMBRIDGE CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE

Tuesday, February 7, 2023

## COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Kathleen Born, Chair  
Kaleb Abebe  
Jessica DeJesus Acevedo  
Mosammat Faria Afreen  
Nikolas Bowie  
Kevin Chen  
Max Clermont  
Jennifer Gilbert  
Kai Long  
Patrick Magee  
Mina Makarious  
Lisa Peterson  
Ellen Shachter  
Susan Shell  
Jim Stockard

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, February 7, 2023. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this meeting was remote via zoom.

**At the request of the Chair, Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

**Kaleb Abebe – Present**  
**Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Present**  
**Mosammat Faria Afreen – Absent**  
**Nikolas Bowie – Present**  
**Kevin Chen – Present**  
**Max Clermont – Present**  
**Jennifer Gilbert – Present**  
**Kai Long – Present**  
**Patrick Magee – Absent\***  
**Mina Makarious – Absent**  
**Lisa Peterson – Absent**  
**Ellen Scachter – Absent**  
**Susan Shell – Absent\***  
**Jim Stockard – Present**  
**Kathleen Born – Present**  
**Present – 10, Absent – 5. Quorum established.**  
**\*Patrick Magee was marked present at 6:44p.m.**  
**\*Susan Shell was marked present at 5:43p.m.**

**Chair Born noted that there were seven written communications that were received from the public (Attachments A-G). Chair Born recognized member Jessica DeJesus Acevedo who made a motion to adopt the written communications and place them on file, the motion was seconded by member Kevin Chen.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

**Kaleb Abebe – Yes**

**Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes**

**Mosammat Faria Afreen – Absent**

**Nikolas Bowie – Yes**

**Kevin Chen – Yes**

**Max Clermont – Yes**

**Jennifer Gilbert – Yes**

**Kai Long – Yes**

**Patrick Magee – Absent**

**Mina Makarious – Absent**

**Lisa Peterson – Absent**

**Ellen Shachter – Yes**

**Susan Shell – Yes**

**Jim Stockard- Yes**

**Kathleen Born – Yes**

**Yes – 11, No – 0, Absent – 4. Motion passed.**

**The Chair, Kathleen Born opened public comment.**

Suzanne Blier thanked Committee members for holding the public forums and noted she looks forward to Committee members speaking on the differences on what is happening with relative proportionality in other municipalities.

Anna Corning began the meeting by introducing Michael Ward, Patricia Lloyd and Elizabeth Corbo from the Collins Center who did an overview of their memo (Attachment H). After the presentation members from the Collins Center made themselves available to Committee members who had any questions or concerns.

Members from the Charter Review Committee went into discussion about elections and their takeaway from the presentation made by the Election Commission from the previous meeting. Members offered comments and suggestions, with some of the topics focused on rank choice voting, reviewing Chapter 54A, its repeal and how it affected Cambridge, voting turnout numbers, the possibility of having four-year and/or alternating terms for Council members, and even and odd year elections.

Michael Ward from the Collins Center shared that there are significant challenges with even number year elections on the same day as State and Federal elections. He noted that there are both State law and Federal law challenges that would have to be thought through. He shared that the Collins Center would look more into it to try and get a better understanding and provide information as it comes.

Member Nikolas Bowie stressed the importance of the role Charter Review Committee members have.

Anna Corning noted that she will pull some data from other cities and towns that have elections that fall on even years to see what the voting turnout numbers are compared to odd years.

Members Jennifer Gilbert, Jessica DeJesus Acevedo, Kevin Chen, Kai Long, and Susan Shell shared their concerns and challenges they took away from the Election Commissions presentation. A suggestion that was made was to have more outreach with public housing to engage and educate to get more voters out. One concern that was brought up was around ward based elections and ward representations, and the challenges that could come with it.

The Chair, Kathleen Born shared that New York currently moved to non-citizen voting for their School Committee, which has been successful. She also noted that some communities have been looking into Universal Suffrage, for a larger expanded group to vote, including younger people. She shared that it is based off the premise that federal aid and representation is built out on a census basis, which includes non-citizens and children, who are people that should be included in the voting process.

Member Kai Long had a clarifying question regarding the possibility of having a digital option for elections. Elizabeth Corbo responded noting that she's not aware of any. Michael Ward shared it is something that the Collins Center can look in to.

Member Jim Stockard offered comments around how to make residents feel more comfortable coming out to vote and was open to suggestions on how the Charter Review Committee could make that possible. He also offered ideas on ballot questions that could potentially help to get more residents out to vote.

Member Patrick Magee shared thoughts on how the community can engage with university type cities and towns, where the turnover population is always changing, and focusing on those specific demographics.

Anna Corning asked members to share their thoughts on the Saturday, January 24, 2023, public forum that was held on Zoom. Member Jennifer Gilbert stressed the importance that if the Charter Review members were going to meet with one ward, it would be important to meet with all wards. The Chair, Kathleen Born agreed and shared that it is good to broaden the Charter Review outreach to as many groups and community members as possible.

Member Kai Long shared that she and member Patrick Magee had interviewed former Mayor and City Council member David Maher and offered comments on what was discussed during the interview. Kai Long noted that she had also interviewed former City Manager Robert Healy and urged other members of the Committee to watch the interview to get his perspective.

Anna Corning shared that she is working on a draft project timeline to help categorize and add goals to future meetings and did a brief overview of what Committee members can look forward to at the upcoming meetings. She asked for the members to start thinking about making a tentative decision on form of government so the Committee can start moving forward.

Members of the Committee offered comments on Mayor versus City Manager form of government and how moving forward the Committee could possibly look at other options besides Mayor versus City Manager. One suggestion was looking at structures within the executive branch and having a document that would be able to summarize the different concepts and would be able to provide pros and cons of different forms of government.

Member Nikolas Bowie noted that having a chart or document on how Councils in Massachusetts oversee their executives would be helpful.

Anna Corning shared that the next meeting will be held on February 28, 2023 and will include a group of Mayors and Managers from different municipalities to speak to the Charter Review Committee members.

Member Kai Long asked if the Committee could possibly get more information from Department Heads or other staff on how they feel about a City Manager form of government, to get a more honest point of view.

**Meeting was adjourned at 7:35p.m.**

The Charter Review Committee received seven written communications, Attachments A-G Attachment H – Memorandum from the Collins Center to the Charter Review Committee

**Clerk's Note:** The video for this meeting can be viewed at:

[https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/441?view\\_id=1&redirect=true&h=0e93353afbb7a0e6697b7df30b769404](https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/441?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=0e93353afbb7a0e6697b7df30b769404)

**MINUTES OF THE CAMBRIDGE  
CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE**  
TUESDAY, JANUARY 31, 2023

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

Kathleen Born, Chair  
Kaleb Abebe  
Jessica DeJesus Acevedo  
Mosammat Faria Afreen  
Nikolas Bowie  
Kevin Chen  
Max Clermont  
Jennifer Gilbert  
Kai Long  
Patrick Magee  
Mina Makarios  
Lisa Peterson  
Ellen Shachter  
Susan Shell  
Jim Stockard

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, January 31, 2023. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this meeting was remote via zoom.

**At the request of the Chair, Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

**Kaleb Abebe – Absent**  
**Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Present**  
**Mosammat Faria Afreen – Present**  
**Nikolas Bowie – Present**  
**Kevin Chen – Present**  
**Max Clermont – Present**  
**Jennifer Gilbert – Present**  
**Kai Long – Present**  
**Patrick Magee – Absent\***  
**Mina Makarios – Present**  
**Lisa Peterson – Absent**  
**Ellen Shachter – Present**  
**Susan Shell – Present**  
**Jim Stockard – Present**  
**Kathleen Born – Present**  
**Present – 12, Absent – 3. Quorum established.**

\*Member Patrick Magee was marked present at 5:38p.m.

**Chair Born opened the meeting with the Adoption of the Minutes from the January 17, 2023 and November 22, 2022 Charter Review Committee meetings. Member Jim Stockard made a motion to adopt both minutes, and the motion was seconded by member Kevin Chen.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

**Kaleb Abebe – Absent**

**Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes**

**Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes**

**Nikolas Bowie – Yes**

**Kevin Chen – Yes**

**Max Clermont – Yes**

**Jennifer Gilbert – Yes**

**Kai Long – Yes**

**Patrick Magee – Yes**

**Mina Makarious – Yes**

**Lisa Peterson – Absent**

**Ellen Shachter – Yes**

**Susan Shell – Yes**

**Jim Stockard – Yes**

**Kathleen Born – Yes**

**Yes – 13, No – 0, Absent – 2. Motion passed.**

**Chair Born noted that there were nine written communications that were received from the public (Attachments A-I). Chair Born recognized member Ellen Shachter who made a motion to adopt the written communications and place them on file, the motion was seconded by member Jim Stockard.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

**Kaleb Abebe – Absent**

**Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes**

**Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes**

**Nikolas Bowie – Yes**

**Kevin Chen – Yes**

**Max Clermont – Yes**

**Jennifer Gilbert – Yes**

**Kai Long – Yes**

**Patrick Magee – Absent**

**Mina Makarious – Yes**

**Lisa Peterson – Absent**

**Ellen Shachter – Yes**

**Susan Shell – Yes**

**Jim Stockard – Yes**

**Kathleen Born – Yes**

**Yes – 12, No – 0, Absent – 3. Motion passed.**

### **The Chair, Kathleen Born opened Public Comment.**

Young Kim, 17 Norris Street, Cambridge, MA, offered comments on ways the Charter Review Committee could help change the City government.

Robert Winters, shared that he would like to see in the Charter Review process a redress of grievances and offered to volunteer to the Charter whenever he is needed.

Lee Farris, shared they attended the public forum and asked if there would be a summary or discussion given to the Committee. She commented that she asked the forum to be more informative in the future.

Anna Corning introduced Elizabeth Corbo and Michael Ward from The Collins Center who did an overview of a memo (Attachment J) they submitted to the Charter Review Committee. After their presentation they made themselves available to Committee members for any questions or concerns.

Member Nikolas Bowie questioned if other cities have changed rules to allow City Council to increase certain aspects of the budget. Elizabeth Corbo responded by sharing that in many municipalities the executive branch is responsible for assembling the budget.

Member Ellen Shachter shared concerns about transparency and free cash and asked for clarity regarding budget discussions with Department Heads and City Manager. Michael Ward was able to provide a response, sharing that there could be ways the City break downs the budget when it comes to free cash.

Member Jim Stockard shared the importance of the City Council having goals when it comes to the budget and referenced the interviews he had done with two former City Managers regarding the budget and offered thoughts on how the process could improve.

Member Mina Makarious echoed comments made by member Jim Stockard about having goals. They shared concerns about the budget process regarding the City Council and public participation and how the Committee should be bold about what the Committee wants from the legislature.

Member Susan Shell noted that she agreed with all the comments made from Committee members who spoke before her.

The Chair, Kathy Born spoke on the importance of goal setting and structure, and how specific the charter could be structured.

Anna Corning introduced Charles Maquardt, Chair of the Election Commission, who was joined by his team member Assistant Director Lesley Waxman, and Commissioners Larry Ward, Ethridge King, and Victoria Harris. Lesley Waxman did a presentation titled "Presentation to the Charter Review Committee" (Attachment K). Members from the Election Commission made themselves available to Committee members for any questions or concerns.

After the Election Commissions presentation, members from the Charter Review Committee offered questions and concerns around the City of Cambridge elections. Topics that were brought up were statutory requirements regarding areas and wards, proportional representation, voter information that is provided through the City on candidates, odd and even number election years and the possibility of having an election during an even numbered year, how voters are informed about how the voting system works, and voter turnout.

**The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Jim Stockard who made a motion to extend the meeting by fifteen minutes. The motion was seconded by member Susan Shell.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

**Kaleb Abebe – Absent**

**Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes**

**Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes**

**Nikolas Bowie – Yes**

**Kevin Chen – Yes**

**Max Clermont – Yes**

**Jennifer Gilbert – Yes**

**Kai Long – Yes**

**Patrick Magee – Yes**

**Mina Makarious – Yes**

**Lisa Peterson – Absent**

**Ellen Shachter – Yes**

**Susan Shell – Yes**

**Jim Stockard – Yes**

**Kathleen Born – Yes**

**Yes – 13, No – 0, Absent – 2. Motion passed.**

The discussion continued with members offering questions and concerns regarding elections. Topics that were brought up were ways the City could get more voters out on election days, rank choice voting, accessibilities that Cambridge is providing for voters who need it at the polls, mail in voting, and having institutes be accountable for their students and registration.

Members from the Election Commission shared the importance of having youth being involved with the voting process, and had students helping at the polls at the last election. They plan on continuing to have youth be involved and stressed the importance of having voters start voting when they are eligible to do so. The team noted that they do student outreach with college students and stressed how it important it is to engage and support registration efforts across the City.

**The Meeting was adjourned at approximately 7:47p.m.**

The Charter Review Committee received nine written communications, Attachments A-I  
Attachment J – Memorandum from The Collins Center Charter Project Team  
Attachment K – Presentation titled, “Presentation to the Charter Review Committee”

**Clerk’s Note:** The video for this meeting can be viewed at:

[https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/431?view\\_id=1&redirect=true&h=689502f35cf7fb77ff48a2e9d91d60aa](https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/431?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=689502f35cf7fb77ff48a2e9d91d60aa)

# MINUTES OF THE CAMBRIDGE CHARTER REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE

Friday, January 27, 2023

## Subcommittee Members

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo  
Jennifer Gilbert  
Kai Long  
Lisa Peterson  
Susan Shell  
Jim Stockard  
Kathleen Born, Chair

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Friday, January 27, 2023. The meeting was called to order at approximately 11:00a.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this meeting was remote via zoom.

## At the request of the Chair, Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Present  
Jennifer Gilbert – Present  
Kai Long – Present  
Lisa Peterson – Absent  
Susan Shell – Present  
Jim Stockard – Present  
Kathleen Born – Present

**Present – 6, Absent – 1. Quorum established.**

Anna Corning began by noting that the meeting would be focusing on the Committee Work Plan and other major topics. She also reviewed the public forum at the Main Library that was held on January 24, 2023, and the turnout of residents.

Member Jennifer Gilbert had a clarifying question about the public forum and if the guests in attendance were people that were familiar with the Charter Review Committee or if people who were in attendance came to get information on the Charter Review. Anna Corning noted that about fifty percent of people were there to learn more about what the Charter Review Committee represented.

Member Jim Stockard shared that there should be more outreach for lower income residents, so they are aware of the Committee and to get more community awareness.

The Chair, Kathleen Born offered suggestions on locations on where the Committee could do more outreach, noting that the youth centers could be appealing to some residents.

Member Susan Shell suggested more transparency on the City website could be beneficial.

Member Kai Long shared that the meeting was very informative, and suggested meetings going forward be more targeted on specific matters.

Member Jessica DeJesus Acevedo shared members from the community asked for more clarity on what the Charter is, and echoed comments made by Kai Long. They stressed the importance of reaching out to minorities and using City spaces that are comfortable for all demographics in the City.

Anna Corning agreed that the Committee does need to reach out to more to the community and offered the idea of informational mail using postcards that could have links, translated informational versions online, and direct residents to more information that is posted on the website.

Member Kai Long shared that the Committee should use more than words when reaching out to different demographics, using tools that are more accessible to those who need it. Break down the communication so it is accessible to a variety of people with different education levels.

Anna Corning stressed the importance of feedback from Committee members when it comes to doing community outreach.

Member Jennifer Gilbert agreed with having more education for the community and with comments made by Kai Long with using different tools to reach out to the different demographics of people.

Member Jim Stockard noted it would be important to have examples and scenario-based questions when speaking to the community about the Charter when it comes to Strong Mayor/Strong Manager and other forms of government. He also suggested reaching out to older students at CRLS who could relay Charter information to family members at home.

Member Jessica DeJesus Acevedo offered ways the Committee could reach out to the school community.

Anna Corning noted that there is a meeting with the City Council in March where Committee members can come and talk with Council members and potentially request an extension.

Member Jennifer Gilbert offered ideas on outreach, suggesting using social media videos and possibly having a contest to help promote information, a way to create content that is about the Charter.

Anna Corning shared she could try and make a connection with staff at CRLS to brainstorm ways to get information out through students.

Member Kai Long stressed the importance of moving forward and asking big questions, answering them, and getting to decisions.

Member Jim Stockard suggested leaning more towards going out to other groups and committees in the City to get information out there to community members who may be hesitant to join forums and meetings that the Charter Review Committee hold.

Anna Corning noted that things are moving forward, and she has seen some feedback and communication from members from the CEOC and Ward 9.

Member Susan Shell shared that the more informed people are, the more informed opinion and point of view they will share.

Member Jessica DeJesus Acevedo offered the idea of having a tentative schedule about when things should be done by to help keep Committee members focused and on track.

Anna Corning stressed the importance of having a work plan going forward to have targeted conversations and shared that a workplan is something she can draft up to bring forward to the full committee.

The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Jessica DeJesus Acevedo who made a motion to create a draft of a work plan to guide Committee members going forward and to propose the workplan to the full Charter Review Committee. The motion was seconded by member Jim Stockard.

**The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Jessica DeJesus Acevedo who made a motion that was seconded by member Jim Stockard to create a draft of a workplan to guide Committee members going forward and propose the workplan to the full Charter Review Committee.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

**Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes**

**Jennifer Gilbert – Yes**

**Kai Long – Yes**

**Lisa Peterson – Absent**

**Susan Shell – Yes**

**Jim Stockard – Yes**

**Kathleen Born – Yes**

**Yes – 6, No – 0, Absent – 1. Motion passed.**

Meeting was adjourned at 12:05p.m.

The video for this meeting can be viewed at:

[https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/429?view\\_id=1&redirect=true&h=87892f06d2f559fd22f927d34862856b](https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/429?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=87892f06d2f559fd22f927d34862856b)

**MINUTES OF THE CAMBRIDGE  
CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE**  
TUESDAY, JANUARY 17, 2023

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

Kathleen Born, Chair  
Kaleb Abebe  
Jessica DeJesus Acevedo  
Mosammat Faria Afreen  
Nikolas Bowie  
Kevin Chen  
Max Clermont  
Jennifer Gilbert  
Kai Long  
Patrick Magee  
Mina Makarious  
Lisa Peterson  
Ellen Shachter  
Susan Shell  
Jim Stockard

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, January 17, 2023. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this meeting was remote via zoom.

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk of Committees called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe – Present  
Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Present  
Mosammat Faria Afreen – Present  
Nikolas Bowie – Present  
Kevin Chen – Present  
Max Clermont – Present  
Jennifer Gilbert – Present  
Kai Long – Present  
Patrick Magee – Absent \*  
Mina Makarious – Absent \*  
Lisa Peterson – Absent  
Ellen Schachter – Present  
Susan Shell – Present  
Jim Stockard – Present  
Kathleen Born – Present

**Present – 11, Absent – 4. Quorum established.**

\*Patrick Magee was marked present at 5:35p.m

\*Mina Makarious was marked present at 5:34p.m.

**Chair Born opened with the Adoption of the Minutes from the January 3, 2023 Charter Review Committee meeting as amended to add Kaleb Abebe's name on the first page under Committee Members. Member Ellen Shachter made a motion to adopt the amended minutes, the motion was seconded by member Jim Stockard.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe – Yes

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Absent

Nikolas Bowie – Yes

Kevin Chen – Yes

Max Clermont – Yes

Jennifer Gilbert – Yes

Kai Long – Yes

Patrick Magee – Yes

Mina Makarios – Yes

Lisa Peterson – Absent

Ellen Shachter – Yes

Susan Shell – Yes

Jim Stockard – Yes

Kathleen Born – Yes

**Yes – 13, No – 0, Absent – 2. Motion passed.**

**Chair Born noted that there was one written communication received from the public (Attachment A). Chair Born recognized member Jim Stockard who made a motion to adopt the communication and place it on file, the motion was seconded by member Kevin Chen.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe – Yes

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Absent

Nikolas Bowie – Yes

Kevin Chen – Yes

Max Clermont – Yes

Jennifer Gilbert – Yes

Kai Long – Yes

Patrick Magee – Yes

Mina Makarios – Yes

Lisa Peterson – Absent

Ellen Shachter – Yes

Susan Shell – Yes

Jim Stockard – Yes

Kathleen Born – Yes

**Yes – 13, No – 0, Absent – 2. Motion passed.**

Anna Corning began the meeting by sharing with members that there have been four interviews completed so far with past City Employees, which included former Deputy City Solicitor Arthur

Goldberg, and the two most recent City Managers, Richard Rossi and Louis DePasquale, and former Mayor and City Council Member Henrietta Davis.

Member Jim Stockard summarized the interviews he had with Arthur Goldberg, Richard Rossi, and Louie DePasquale, who all shared they believed the City functions well with the current government system. Some concerns that came up was having the budget process start sooner and possibly having the City Council set a goal setting type meeting to help prepare for the budget. Some commented that the City Manager should be appointing Department heads, while the City Council appoints members to Boards and Commissions. One thing they were all in favor of was having as much public engagement as possible.

Anna Corning reminded members of the upcoming public engagement forums on and that she was trying to plan meetings with the School Committee and City Council in the future. After updates, Anna Corning introduced David Kale, Assistant City Manager for Finance, who was joined by his team, Michelle Kincaid, Assistant Finance Director, Taha Jennings, Budget Director, and Angela Pierre, Deputy Budget Director.

David Kale began the Finance team's presentation titled, "City of Cambridge Budget Presentation" (Attachment B), pointing out that the City of Cambridge's budget is a direct reflection of its priorities and values as a community and is shaped by many sources of input. Other members from the Finance team also spoke, sharing that the majority of Cambridge's revenue comes from real estate taxes, Massachusetts law dictate the annual budget's high-level timeline as well as the City Manager and the city Council's role in the process, and the budget process is a year-long, structured and collaborative effort by the City Council, department heads, and the budget team.

After the Finance presentation, many members from the Charter Review Committee offered questions and concerns about the City's budget. Some topics that were brought up were Harvard and MIT's contribution to the City as nonprofit, how decisions get made about where and how much funding goes towards a certain area, funding for schools, increasing funding towards other City departments, statutory laws on budget, the Councils power when it comes to denying an item on the budget, and the City's free cash. David Kale and his team were available to respond, noting that the budget is a tool to implement city programs and policies, it's not always the first step on the process of addressing an issue, other planning and steps must happen first and then the budget makes sure the resources are available to make it happen.

**The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Patrick Magee who made a motion to extend the meeting fifteen minutes, the motion was seconded by member Kai Long. Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe – Yes

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Absent

Nikolas Bowie – Yes

Kevin Chen – Yes

Max Clermont – Yes

Jennifer Gilbert – Yes

Kai Long – Yes  
Patrick Magee – Yes  
Mina Makarious – Yes  
Lisa Peterson – Absent  
Ellen Shachter – Absent  
Susan Shell – Yes  
Jim Stockard – Yes  
Kathleen Born – Yes

**Yes – 13, No – 0, Absent – 3. Motion passed.**

**The Chair, Kathleen Born opened Public Comment.**

John Hawkinson highlighted comments that were made during the January 3, 2023, meeting regarding free cash and read a paragraph from the tax rate letter regarding the FY23 budget.

**Anna Corning read a Q&A that was submitted through the Zoom during the meeting from a member of the public:**

I'm still a little confused about how exactly the public is participating in the free cash conversation. Maybe I missed it, but exactly at what meeting is public comment available to weigh on this in particular? Is it just on the one Council meeting where the Council approves how free cash is used in the budget to balance the budget, but not the specifics on how it's used? If I'm understanding correctly, there are no public meetings specifically about free cash usage, it's more like one small part in the budget that the council is voting on.

Members from the Finance team responded, noting that whenever the Finance team goes up to Council for approval to use free cash that would be an opportunity for the public to weigh in. Whenever free cash is looked to being used it must go before the Council and would be on the Council Agenda.

Elliot Veloso, First Assistant City Solicitor for the Law Department, commented on a question member Ellen Shachter raised regarding the power of the City Council denying an item in the budget and whether they can raise one. Due to it being a legal question that the Finance team was unable to answer, Elliot noted that the Law Department can research this issue and bring it back to the Committee after their review analysis.

The Chair, Kathleen born thanked Committee members and the Finance team for participating in the meeting.

**The Charter Review Committee adjourned at approximately 7:45p.m.**

Attachment A – Written Communication from John Hanratty  
Attachment B – “City of Cambridge Budget Presentation”

**Clerk's Note:** The video for this meeting can be viewed at:

[https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/400?view\\_id=1&redirect=true&h=8220c78dba0a14ff69347230a003e9d5](https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/400?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=8220c78dba0a14ff69347230a003e9d5)

**MINUTES OF THE CAMBRIDGE  
CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE**  
TUESDAY, JANUARY 3, 2023

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

Kathleen Born, Chair  
Jessica DeJesus Acevedo  
Mosammat Faria Afreen  
Nikolas Bowie  
Kevin Chen  
Max Clermont  
Jennifer Gilbert  
Kai Long  
Patrick Magee  
Mina Makarios  
Lisa Peterson  
Ellen Shachter  
Susan Shell  
Jim Stockard

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, December 20, 2022. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this meeting was remote via zoom.

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

Kaled Abebe – Present  
Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Present  
Mosammat Faria Afreen – Present  
Nikolas Bowie – Absent\*  
Kevin Chen – Absent  
Max Clermont – Present  
Jennifer Gilbert – Present  
Kai Long – Present  
Patrick Magee – Present  
Mina Makarios – Absent\*  
Lisa Peterson – Present  
Ellen Shachter – Present  
Susan Shell – Present  
Jim Stockard – Present  
Kathleen Born, Chair – Present

**Present – 12 Absent – 3. Quorum established**

\*Nikolas Bowie and Mina Makarios were both marked present at 5:42p.m.

**Chair Born opened the meeting with the Adoption of the Minutes from the December 20, 2022, Charter Review meeting and the December 13, 2022 Charter Review Subcommittee meeting.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe – Yes

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes

Nikolas Bowie – Absent

Kevin Chen – Absent

Max Clermont – Yes

Jennifer Gilbert – Yes

Kai Long – Yes

Patrick Magee – Yes

Mina Makarios – Absent

Lisa Peterson – Yes

Ellen Shachter – Yes

Susan Shell – Yes

Jim Stockard – Yes

Kathleen Born, Chair – Yes

**Yes – 12, No – 0, Absent – 3. Motion passes.**

**The Chair noted that there was two Communications submitted from the Public (Attachment A and Attachment B).**

**Chair Born recognized a motion from member Jim Stockard and seconded by member Kaleb Abebe to place the two Communications on file.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe – Yes

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes

Nikolas Bowie – Absent

Kevin Chen – Absent

Max Clermont – Yes

Jennifer Gilbert – Yes

Kai Long – Yes

Patrick Magee – Yes

Mina Makarios – Absent

Lisa Peterson – Yes

Ellen Shachter – Yes

Susan Shell – Yes

Jim Stockard – Yes

Kathleen Born, Chair – Yes

**Yes – 12, No – 0, Absent – 3. Motion passes.**

Anna Corning began the meeting by reviewing the next steps of the Charter Review, which included an overview of the panel, upcoming city presentations from the Finance Department and Election Commission, interviews, and a community engagement update.

Member Ellen Shachter had clarifying questions about relaying the basic fundamentals of the charter to the public, Anna Corning responded by noting she has documents that members can use to help the public have a better understanding.

Elliot Veloso, First Assistant City Solicitor for the Law Department, commented that because the Charter Review Committee may be starting to take official actions with scheduling community engagement and reaching out to the public, he advises that members should be taking formal votes because they are official acts being taken by the Committee, and by doing this there is an official record. He advised the members that any official action that the committee is taking, there should be a roll call vote so the Clerk can record it.

The Chair, Kathleen Born had a clarifying question about votes being taken at Planning Subcommittee meetings. Elliot Veloso responded by noting that if there were a decision by the Planning Subcommittee, the Subcommittee can take a vote, but that would be a vote to refer it to the Committee as a whole.

Anna Corning opened up conversation to members of the Committee for comments and concerns about the discussion notes from the December 20, 2022 meeting, titled “Summary of 12/20 Round Table Discussion” (Attachment C).

Member Ellen Shachter asked if Anna Corning would be able to add Ward versus At Large to the discussion notes, to which Anna Corning agreed to add.

Member Susan Shell had a clarifying question about rank choice voting. Anna Corning responded by noting rank choice voting was not a topic that was brought up in the previous discussion but would add it as a piece members would like to talk about.

Elizabeth Corbo, Human Resource Auditor an Employment Operations Analyst for the Edward J. Collins, Jr. Center for Public Management, offered comments and suggestions to the members of the Committee about the discussion notes, stressing the importance of engagement with community by using a form of government to do that, increasing the transparency and accountability with voters, creating a balance of authority with the legislative and executive branches of authority, and making a change in government more accessible to voters.

Elliot Veloso advised the Chair, Kathleen Born, to entertain a motion to place the December 20, 2022 meeting notes on file.

**Chair Born recognized a motion from member Jim Stockard and seconded by member Susan Shell to add the “Summary of 12/20 Round Tanle Discussion (Attachment C) to the record of the meeting minutes and place them on file.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe – Yes

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes

Nikolas Bowie – Yes

Kevin Chen – Absent

Max Clermont – Yes  
Jennifer Gilbert – Yes  
Kai Long – Yes  
Patrick Magee – Yes  
Mina Makarios – Yes  
Lisa Peterson – Yes  
Ellen Shachter – Yes  
Susan Shell – Yes  
Jim Stockard – Yes  
Kathleen Born, Chair – Yes

**Yes – 14, No – 0, Absent – 1. Motion passes.**

The Chair, Kathleen Born offered comments about the December 20, 2022 discussion notes and suggested that members think about the Council making policy, how the Manager implements the policy, and how residents might be able to influence and communicate with the City Manager.

Members Susan Shell, Kai Long, Jim Stockard, Mina Makarios, Jennifer Gilbert, Ellen Shachter, Lisa Peterson, Nikolas Bowie, Kathleen Born voiced their concerns and shared opinions on legislative and executive branches forms of government, policy and administration, and the current government system in Cambridge. They also offered suggestions on ways members should be engaging with the public and how they want to see the government represented. Many members stressed the importance of citizen participation and involvement.

**Chair Born recognized a motion from member Mina Markarios and seconded by member Kaleb Abebe, that the Committee will designate the Charter Review Committee staff to plan public engagement events on January 21, 2023 and February 2, 2023. The staff will use the prepared flier (Attachment D) and public information available on <https://www.cambridgema.gov/charterreview> in order to publicize engagement efforts. Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe – Yes  
Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes  
Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes  
Nikolas Bowie – Yes  
Kevin Chen – Absent  
Max Clermont – Yes  
Jennifer Gilbert – Yes  
Kai Long – Yes  
Patrick Magee – Yes  
Mina Makarios – Yes  
Lisa Peterson – Yes  
Ellen Shachter – Yes  
Susan Shell – Yes  
Jim Stockard – Yes  
Kathleen Born, Chair – Yes

**Yes – 14, No – 0, Absent – 1. Motion passes.**

Elizabeth Corbo noted that she was accompanied by her colleagues Michael Ward and Patricia Lloyd, and they did an overview of their presentation titled “Example Baseline Cambridge Charter in Modern Format” (Attachment E).

Members of the Committee had clarifying questions and comments throughout the presentation to which Elizabeth Corbo and Michael Ward were able to respond respectively.

Member Ellen Shachter suggested that the Committee form smaller working groups to focus on specific parts of drafting new articles going forward.

**Anna Corning opened public comment.**

**Public Comment**

John Hawkinson spoke on comments made by members of the Committee, statutory deadlines, and the City’s budget.

Jameson Quinn spoke on participation as it relates to a voting system, moving elections to even years, filling vacancies, and campaign financing and democracy vouchers.

**The Chair, Kathleen Born recognized member Jim Stockard who made a motion that was seconded by member Patrick Magee to amend the previous motion to read “That the Committee will designate the Charter Review Committee staff to plan public engagement events on January 21, 2023 and ~~February 2, 2023~~ February 4, 2023. The staff will use the prepared flier (Attachment D) and public information available on <https://www.cambridgema.gov/charterreview> in order to publicize engagement efforts.”**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe – Yes

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes

Nikolas Bowie – Absent

Kevin Chen – Absent

Max Clermont – Yes

Jennifer Gilbert – Yes

Kai Long – Yes

Patrick Magee – Yes

Mina Makarios – Yes

Lisa Peterson – Yes

Ellen Shachter – Yes

Susan Shell – Yes

Jim Stockard – Yes

Kathleen Born, Chair – Yes

**Yes – 13, No – 0, Absent – 2. Motion passes.**

**The Charter Review Committee was adjourned at approximately 7:30p.m.**

Two written Communications were received from the public, Attachments A & B.

Attachment C - Summary of 12/20 Round Table Discussion

Attachment D – Your Guide to the Cambridge Charter Review Flier

Attachment E – Example Baseline Cambridge Charter in Modern Format

**Clerk’s Note:** The video for this meeting can be viewed at:

[https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/387?view\\_id=1&redirect=true&h=22e978a469c4e8a2261ec1d6b4f3c6e](https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/387?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=22e978a469c4e8a2261ec1d6b4f3c6e)

**MINUTES OF THE CAMBRIDGE  
CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE  
DECEMBER 20, 2022**

**COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

Kathleen Born, Chair  
Jessica DeJesus Acevedo  
Mosammat Faria Afreen  
Nikolas Bowie  
Kevin Chen  
Max Clermont  
Jennifer Gilbert  
Kai Long  
Patrick Magee  
Mina Makarious  
Lisa Peterson  
Ellen Shachter  
Susan Shell  
Jim Stockard

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, December 20, 2022. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this meeting was remote via zoom.

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

Kaled Abebe – Present  
Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Present  
Mosammat Faria Afreen – Present  
Nikolas Bowie – Present  
Kevin Chen – Present  
Max Clermont – Present  
Jennifer Gilbert – Present  
Kai Long – Present  
Patrick Magee – Present  
Mina Makarious – Present  
Lisa Peterson – Present  
Ellen Shachter – Present  
Susan Shell – Present  
Jim Stockard – Present  
Kathleen Born, Chair - Present

**Present – 15 Absent – 0. Quorum established.**

**Chair Born opened the meeting with the Adoption of the Minutes of the December 6, 2022, meeting and recognized a motion from member Jim Stockard and seconded by member Ellen Shachter.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

Kaled Abebe – Yes

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes

Nikolas Bowie – Yes

Kevin Chen – Yes

Max Clermont – Yes

Jennifer Gilbert – Yes

Kai Long – Yes

Patrick Magee – Yes

Mina Makarios – Yes

Lisa Peterson – Yes

Ellen Shachter – Yes

Susan Shell – Yes

Jim Stockard – Yes

Kathleen Born, Chair - Yes

**Yes – 15 No – 0. Motion passes.**

**The Chair noted that there was one Communication submitted from Dr. Jameson Quinn (ATTACHMENT A).**

**The Chair recognized a motion from member Jim Stockard and seconded by member Mosammat Faria Afreen to place the Communication on file.**

**Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

Kaled Abebe – Yes

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes

Nikolas Bowie – Yes

Kevin Chen – Yes

Max Clermont – Yes

Jennifer Gilbert – Yes

Kai Long – Yes

Patrick Magee – Yes

Mina Makarios – Yes

Lisa Peterson – Yes

Ellen Shachter – Yes

Susan Shell – Yes

Jim Stockard – Yes

Kathleen Born, Chair - Yes

**Yes – 15 No – 0. Motion passes.**

Anna Corning began the meeting by reviewing the next steps for interviews and opened discussion to members for their input.

Member Ellen Shachter shared their thoughts and concerns about interview questions, and suggested the focus be more on engagement with the City Council and less focus on the charter.

Jim Stockard noted that he didn't want to raise expectations for residents and that the committee should try and be as straight forward as possible to achieve goals for the City.

Member Jennifer Gilbert had a clarifying question on the surveys and suggested if they should be anonymous because people may be more truthful with their answers. She noted that she hoped to interview external people who have no ties to Cambridge.

Anna Corning noted that it was a good idea to make the survey anonymous to help people feel as comfortable as possible.

Member Susan Shell made suggestions on people the Committee could interview.

Member Max Clermont agreed with comments and questions from other members and noted that starting public engagement and seeing how the process will go sooner is a good idea, Committee needs to start seeing data.

Member Lisa Peterson noted that if we are expecting to have thirty minute or longer interviews, members should limit the questions to only four or five. She also suggested that the Committee look at current and past School Committee members. Most people will have basic opinions, but others will have very detailed feedback. She suggested focusing on elections and voting.

Chair Born noted that she liked all the suggestions being made by members and is eager to get started with the process. She noted that it's ok if discussion is ongoing during the work being done.

Member Kai Long stressed her concerns about the length of the list and questioned if the members can organize the list so it's helpful to the Committee.

Member Mosammat Faria Afreen shared concerns about talking to people who are already in the City government, and noted that the Committees time should be focused on those who are not currently within the government.

Member Mina Makarious noted the interviews could be productive if the Committee asks to have members from City Council and other boards and committees allow the Charter Review Committee interviews to be on their agenda in order to get the feedback the Committee is looking for and it would be an opportunity for residents to be able to listen in on multiple occasions.

Member Lisa Peterson suggested doing smaller focus groups and noted the importance of interviewing neighborhood groups. Noting that the Committee should look in to interviewing executive directors to get their insight on what is working and what is not working for them as employees.

Chair Born commented that she has spoken with the City Manager, and he is more than willing to be interviewed.

Member Jennifer Gilbert shared concerns about acting on the community engagement and interview plans. Jennifer also suggested having the option for Panel or individual survey to help people being interviewed feel comfortable and whichever setting.

Member Max Clermont had clarifying questions for community outreach.

Anna Corning noted that in January there will be two public forums. The first on Tuesday, January 24<sup>th</sup> at a Library for residents to provide comments and then the following Saturday residents would have the opportunity to participate virtually.

Patrick Hayes Emphasize it is up to the committee to engage with the community and do the hard work.

Anna Corning opened discussion to all members on what is working about the City Council/City Manager form of government, what are the challenges about the City Council/City Manager form of government and should the city form of government stay the same or change. What have you heard is working well, what needs improvement from members of the community.

Members went into discussion about the challenges and concerns they feel as residents. Noting that there is a disconnect between the political side of the government and professional side. Many members commented that they were intrigued by a strong Mayor form government. Members noted that a goal for the Charter should be to strengthen the government we already have, and that we should have a government that focuses on helping residents and getting things done, and that it's slow to make change in Cambridge. There were comments made that there is divide between the rich and the poor, and Cambridge does not have a strong middle class. Some members suggested looking at the School Committee as an option to help with planning and reorganizing. A big concern was voting for politicians and not seeing the outcome that was promised.

Chair Born noted that the discussions tonight were very meaningful, and every member had brought great suggestions and thoughts forward. She thanked members for their input.

### **Public Comment**

John Hawkinson offered informational comments, noting that much of the assessment of the system seem right now to depend on the new City Manager and the Council supervision of him.

Anna Corning offered members to discuss if there were any lingering questions or comments based on the discussions of the meeting.

Chair Born suggested the Committee discuss how they would like to proceed with the next meeting, with hopes that members can take the framework that has been provided and use it to focus on future discussions.

Member Mosammat Faria Afreen stressed the importance of being able to explain form of government and how the city government operates to people.

Member Jennifer Gilbert noted the importance of bringing actual data to the discussion, so members have something to look at and go off of.

Member Jim Stockard suggested the Committee look at the National City Manager Association to see what they could offer in terms of evaluation formats and histories of relationships between Council members and Managers.

Chair Born and Anna Corning thanked everyone for their participation.

**Meeting was adjourned at approximately 7:28p.m.**

**The Charter Review Committee received one written communication, Attachment A**

**Clerk's Note:** The video for this meeting can be viewed at:

[https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/384?view\\_id=1&redirect=true&h=b0c14ed8855894066df36616103f52e6](https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/384?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=b0c14ed8855894066df36616103f52e6)

# MINUTES OF THE CAMBRIDGE CHARTER REVIEW SUBCOMMITTEE

Tuesday, December 13, 2022

## **Subcommittee Members**

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo  
Jennifer Gilbert  
Kai Long  
Lisa Peterson  
Susan Shell  
Jim Stockard  
Kathleen Born, Chair

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, December 13, 2022. The meeting was called to order at approximately 11:00a.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this meeting was remote via zoom.

## **At the request of the Chair, Clerk of Committees Erwin called the roll.**

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Absent \*  
Jennifer Gilbert – Present  
Kai Long – Present  
Lisa Peterson – Present  
Susan Shell – Present  
Jim Stockard – Present  
Kathleen Born – Present

**Present – 6, Absent – 1. Quorum established.**

**\*Jessica DeJesus Acevedo was marked present at 11:30a.m.**

Also present at the meeting were Elliot Veloso, Assistant City Solicitor for the Law Department, and Elizabeth Corbo, Human Resource Auditor an Employment Operations Analyst for the Edward J. Collins, Jr. Center for Public Management.

Anna Corning gave opening remarks about what the purpose of the Subcommittee should be. That members in the subcommittee should be working towards creating an overall road map for the committee and a list of what topics the Committee might cover.

Member Lisa Peterson commented that it's important to think about the timeline and trying to create both the committee and subcommittee, so topics are discussed in a time appropriate manner.

Member Susan Shell shared concerns about the process of creating a new Plan E, and if the public would agree on topics discussed in meetings. They noted that the possibility of doing a survey to get feedback could help with these challenges.

Anna Corning noted that we could rely on Community groups to help document the broader themes to help the public figure out what is or is not working.

Elizabeth Corbo noted that the subcommittee will impact all the decisions that the Charter Review will ultimately make. They stressed that the Charter Review Committee is the representative government committee, the voice. Members should feel comfortable in what they are doing.

Kai Long noted that with government you want the thought process to be more thoughtful. Shared concerns about how the Committee can start this process with out the input of residents. They spoke against surveys and suggested the Committee find a better way to reach out to residents.

Member Jim Stockard commented on the power and assignment given to the Charter Review Committee and reiterated the importance of reaching out to residents in a form that is not a survey.

Elizabeth Corbo stressed concerns that the Charter Review Committee members may not understand the importance of their role as members.

Members went into discussion about questions and concerns they have about what is working and what is not working in Cambridge and noting they need time to be able to discuss the pros and cons, getting familiar with strong Mayor/strong Manager, talk about concerns, and encouraging conversation. Members noted the importance of focusing on Cambridge government more and to not be so abstract by looking at other cities and towns. Other concerns that were brought forward was a timeline and if the Charter Review would have enough time to accomplish their goals.

Elliot Veloso reviewed the timeline that was given to Chair Born from the Law Department and reiterated some of the language that is written in the Council Order and Charter language, and that there is a possibility for extension.

Anna Corning suggested putting together an interview structure to interview past and current employees to get feedback and noted she had sent out a list to members already.

Member Susan Shell suggested getting material ahead of time to make the time they have for these meetings more useful.

Member Jennifer Gilbert had questions and comments about the list of interviewees and encouraged that the Committee add as many voices as possible.

Member Jim Stockard noted that all residents should be represented fairly.

The Chair, Kathleen Born noted the importance of getting started so the Committee can get to the conversation that needs to happen to reach goals and questioned how often it would be useful for the subcommittee to continue meeting.

Members Susan Shell, Jessica DeJesus Acevedo, and Kai Long had suggestions, questions, and recommendations on how the Committee can go forward with interviewing people. Jessica DeJesus Acevedo stressed the importance of engaging with the community.

Anna Corning thanked members for giving their time for the meeting.

**Meeting was adjourned at approximately 11:04a.m.**

**Clerk's Note:** The video for this meeting can be viewed at:

[Dec 13, 2022 5:30 PM - Charter Review Committee - Committee Meeting \(granicus.com\)](#)

## **MINUTES OF THE CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE**

Tuesday, December 6, 2022

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, December 6, 2022. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this meeting was remote via zoom.

### **At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

Kaled Abebe – Present

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Present

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Present

Nikolas Bowie – Present

Kevin Chen – Present

Max Clermont – Present

Jennifer Gilbert – Present

Kai Long – Present

Patrick Magee – Present

Mina Makarious – Absent

Lisa Peterson – Present

Ellen Shachter – Present

Susan Shell – Present

Jim Stockard – Present

Kathleen Born, Chair - Present

**Present – 14 Absent – 1. Quorum established.**

Chair Born opened the meeting with the Adoption of the Minutes of the November 8, 2022, meeting and recognized a motion from member Jim Stockard and seconded by member Patrick Magee.

Kaled Abebe – Yes

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes

Nikolas Bowie – Yes

Kevin Chen – Yes

Max Clermont – Yes

Jennifer Gilbert – Yes

Kai Long – Yes

Patrick Magee – Yes

Mina Makarious – Absent

Lisa Peterson – Yes

Ellen Shachter – Yes

Susan Shell – Yes

Jim Stockard – Yes

Kathleen Born, Chair - Yes

**Yes – 14 No – 0 Absent – 1. Motion passes.**

The Chair noted that there was one Communication from member Jessica Acevedo. The Chair recognized a motion from member Kevin Chen and seconded by member Kai Long to place the Communication on file.

Kaled Abebe – Yes  
Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Yes  
Mosammat Faria Afreen – Yes  
Nikolas Bowie – Yes  
Kevin Chen – Yes  
Max Clermont – Yes  
Jennifer Gilbert – Yes  
Kai Long – Yes  
Patrick Magee – Yes  
Mina Makarios – Absent  
Lisa Peterson – Yes  
Ellen Shachter – Yes  
Susan Shell – Yes  
Jim Stockard – Yes  
Kathleen Born, Chair - Yes

**Yes – 14 No – 0 Absent – 1. Motion passes.**

Anna Corning introduced the Committee Values Statement Proposal that the writing team has been working on.

Members Lisa Peterson and Mosammat Faria Afreen thanked the writing team and had clarifying questions with some parts of the statement and suggestions for improvement. Discussion between members took place on small changes to be made to the Values Statement.

**Anna Corning asked members to vote fist to five on voting to take action and accept the Committee Value Statement.**

Kaled Abebe – Five  
Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Five  
Mosammat Faria Afreen – Five  
Nikolas Bowie – Five  
Kevin Chen – Five  
Max Clermont – Five  
Jennifer Gilbert – Five  
Kai Long – Five  
Patrick Magee – Five  
Mina Makarios – Absent  
Lisa Peterson – Five  
Ellen Shachter – Five  
Susan Shell – Five  
Jim Stockard – Five  
Kathleen Born, Chair - Five

**Fourteen members recorded voting five and one member recorded as absent.**

Michael Ward from the Collins Center did an overview of the Plan E Charter. They also did a detailed review of an Exemplar Charter, which included preamble, incorporation; short title; definitions, legislative branch, executive branch, school committee, administrative organization, financial procedures, elections, citizen participation mechanisms, general provisions, and transition provisions. They noted that the legislative branch is where the Charter begins to define division of powers between the executive and legislative branch, which all depends on what the Committee decides on form of government.

Member Susan Shell questioned what the procedure is when a change in the Charter is put into effect and clarification on how the Charter Review Committee was set up. Michael Ward responded and provided information on what the process would be for the Charter Review Committee.

Member Kaleb Abebe had a clarifying question on amending current charter versus drafting new language. Michael Ward responded with pros and cons of doing each. Anna Corning also noted that the Committee would not be starting from scratch if new language was drafted and would be able to use existing text from other sources.

Member Jennifer Gilbert noted that Charter Committee’s focus is to have the government be more accessible. They noted it could be a good idea to start from scratch to reach common goals, create a more readable Charter, and the opportunity for all people to have power within the government.

There was discussion between members Mosammat Faria Afreen, Ellen Shachter, and Lisa Peterson on the positive effects of drafting new language and that change could be good, noting that this would be a good opportunity for the Charter.

**Anna Corning asked members to vote fist to five on drafting new text for the Plan E Charter.**

Kaled Abebe – Five

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo – Five

Mosammat Faria Afreen – Five

Nikolas Bowie – Five

Kevin Chen – Five

Max Clermont – Five

Jennifer Gilbert – Five

Kai Long – Five

Patrick Magee – Five

Mina Makarious – Absent

Lisa Peterson – Five

Ellen Shachter – Five

Susan Shell – Five

Jim Stockard – Five

Kathleen Born, Chair - Five

**Fourteen members recorded voting five and one member recorded as absent.**

The next topic that Anna Corning introduced was to review the forms of government.

Michael Ward did a quick overview of the basic forms of government in Massachusetts, which included examples from both City and Town governments. Noting that Cambridge uses City form of government that has the option to use a Mayoral form (elected Mayor leads executive branch) or Council- Manager form (appointed Manager leads executive branch). They opened it up to the Committee, looking for what questions members had and what information members need to know so the Committee can start moving forward.

Member Susan Shell asked if there was any general information, pros and cons, or any thought out research that members could look at to help with decision making. Michael Ward responded that it is something the Collins Center could provide. Anna Corning noted that they have also put resources on the Charter Review website about charter and charter review.

Member Ellen Shachter questioned if the City Council or department heads from the city in the Executive branches would be able to give feedback on their thoughts. They also questioned if a survey is possible, to which Michael Ward responded noting that surveys have been done in the past. Michael suggested that it could be possible to get a panel of Mayors, Managers, and Councillors from other cities to hear their perspectives. Anna Corning mentioned the possibility of getting a list of interviewees that could include previous mayors, managers, and department heads from the City of Cambridge, to gather their thoughts and feedback.

Member Mosammat Faria Afreen noted that they would be interested in seeing how cities in other countries are run. They noted that they are interested in seeing the Charter create a form of government which welcomes community participation.

Member Jennifer Gilbert had comments on community participation and elections and how the Charter can focus on the good of both Mayor and Manager government.

Member Nikolas Bowie noted they would like to see what other forms of government look like besides the two presented and the importance of expanding government to look beyond the City of Cambridge and Massachusetts.

Member Kai Long noted they liked the idea of having both a Mayor and City Council and noted they agreed with the idea of looking at other forms of government in other countries to help make our politics not dependent on personality versus what they are going to do if elected.

Member Max Clermont made comments on a Town Manager and town meetings, and how the City could incorporate something similar to a town meeting in city government because of the positive benefits.

Member Lisa Peterson questioned what the accountability should look like for Mayors and City Managers, what form of resident involvement is best to hold them to their accountability and if there are any additional ways accountability can be built into the system.

Michael Ward offered final comments and answered some questions that were brought to their attention during discussion with members.

Member Jim Stockard asked for guidance from Michael Ward on good public bodies.

Chair Kathleen Born questioned how to further define the interactions between the City Council and City Manager and if the budgeting process would be able to tie policies together.

Kevin Chen noted members have made a lot of good points and have raised interesting questions. They brought up the possibility of using citizen juries.

Jessica DeJesus Acevedo asked for clarifying comments on what the writing process would look like for drafting a new Plan E. They asked for more data on cost of elections and campaigns, and how this reflects the representation and leadership in Cambridge.

Anna Corning opened Public Comment.

**Public Comment**

John Hawkinson spoke on the City Manager's 90 Day Report.

Jameson Quinn spoke on discussions from today's meeting.

**Adjournment at approximately 7:53p.m.**

DRAFT

## MINUTES OF THE CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE

Tuesday, November 22, 2022

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, November 22, 2022. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30 p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this public meeting was remote via zoom.

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                              | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo           | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen             | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson)       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie                     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                        | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                      | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jennifer Gilbert                  | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Kai Long                          | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee                     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson (joined at 5:40pm)  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter(joined at 5:40 pm) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                       | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jim Stockard                      | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>                | <b>13</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>2</b>                            |
|                                   | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

**13 members recorded as present. 2 members recorded as absent.**

The Chair brought forward the following Communications to the Committee to be placed on file:

- Communications from Committee Members
  - Communication from Member Susan Shell
- Communications from Council Members
  - N/A
- Communications from the Public
  - Communication from Alan Sadun
  - Communication from Josiah Someone
  - Communication from Robin Chen

**Chair Born recognized a motion from Member Jim Stockard to place the Communications on file. The motion was seconded by Member Kai Long.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                        | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jennifer Gilbert            | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Kai Long                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                 | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jim Stockard                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>          | <b>13</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>2</b>                            |
|                             | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

**The motion to place the Communications received by the Committee on file passed with 13 members voting in the affirmative and 2 members recorded as absent.**

Chair Born invited Anna Corning, Patrick Hayes, Elizabeth Corbo, and Michael Ward to begin the discussion. Anna Corning started with an overview of the materials sent to members regarding selection of a decision-making process. She said that most members were interested in using the ‘Fist-to-Five’ method of voting and explained some details about the method. At Ms. Corning’s suggestion, the committee practiced a ‘Fist-to-Five’ vote and took a vote to approve the use of this decision-making process with the following results:

**Fist-to-Five Vote to approve use of this decision-making process:**

- 0/fist-none
- 1-none
- 2-none
- 3-none
- 4-Four
- 5-Nine

**The practice vote to approve the ‘Fist-to-Five’ voting method for decision-making passed with 4 ‘Four’ votes and 5 ‘Five’ votes.**

There was some clarifying conversation on when the 'Fist-to-Five' vote would be used. Elliot Veloso (Cambridge Law Dept.) explained that 'Fist-to-Five' would be used to gauge consensus during discussions, then when there is a final decision a roll call vote would be taken in accordance with Robert's Rules. Ms. Corning further clarified that this method will be used for tentative matters/gauging consensus on matters. Ms. Corbo stated that anything requiring formal action or adoption could be decided by a formal vote. The discussion concluded with Ms. Corning stated the wish of the committee to use 'Fist-to-Five' as a discussion tool and retain the use of formal voting for procedural and formal decisions.

**On a motion from Member Jim Stockard to adopt the 'Fist-to-Five' voting method (as amended) as a decision-making tool. The motion was seconded by Max Clermont.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                              | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo           | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen             | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson)       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie                     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                        | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                      | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jennifer Gilbert                  | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Kai Long                          | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee                     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson (joined at 5:40pm)  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter(joined at 5:40 pm) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                       | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jim Stockard                      | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>                | <b>13</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>2</b>                            |
|                                   | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

**The motion to adopt the 'Fist-to-Five' voting method (as amended) as a decision-making tool passed with 13 members voting in the affirmative and 2 members recorded as absent.**

Ms. Corning stated that the amended proposal would be forwarded to members and posted online to the Charter Review webpage.

Member Kaleb Abebe suggested the Fist-to-Five vote for the adoption of the Committee Ground Rules. Ms. Corning called the vote as follows.

**Fist to Five Vote to adopt the Committee Ground Rules:**

- 0/fist-none
- 1-none
- 2-none
- 3-none

4-One

5-Twelve

(2 members absent)

Ms. Corning next led a review of the submission of values from members. Member Mina Markarious explained that the writing group attempted to capture sentiments that were broad and pertinent to the group goals specifically in its initial draft.

Members discussed the draft values document. Member Acevedo explained that the writing group used the headings from the collective key words received from members to create a concise vision statement. She asked members if there were sentences or words that were preferred, stating that the writing group would welcome that feedback on the draft. Ms. Corning explained that the writing team will use the conversation to prepare a second draft of the values to be voted on in the next meeting. Member Stockard asked if the group needed to acknowledge the statement sent by Member Susan Shell (and shared with the committee by Ms. Corning, as Ms. Shell was absent from the meeting). Member Max Clermont stated that Member Shell's statements should be considered in the same manner as other submitted thoughts. Chair Born stated her belief that there is a way to make statements about past wrongs while avoiding raising tensions without glossing over what has happened through word crafting. Member Peterson stated that without Member Shell in attendance, her statement should be referred to the next meeting when Member Shell is present and can articulate her concerns.

Ms. Corning moved the discussion on to the Community Engagement Working Document. The Committee discussed ideas for public engagement including a revised website, newsletter, virtual/in-person forums, and mailers to support public engagement. Chair Born stated that there is a 7-member planning committee and suggested that their first public meeting be to discuss a thought-out plan for community engagement.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Jameson Quinn commented that they are working on a piece regarding voting systems in Cambridge and other comparable cities and asked for help accessing raw ballot data from recent elections.

The meeting was adjourned at appx 7:35pm.

## MINUTES OF THE CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE

Tuesday, November 8, 2022

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, November 8, 2022. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30 p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this public meeting was remote via zoom.

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                              | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                       | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo           | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen             | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson)       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie                     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                        | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                      | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kai Long                          | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee                     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson (joined at 5:40pm)  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter(joined at 5:40 pm) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jim Stockard                      | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>                | <b>13</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>2</b>                            |
|                                   | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

**13 members recorded as present. 2 members recorded as absent.**

The Chair opened the meeting with the Adoption of the Minutes of the October 25, 2022, meeting.

**Chair Born recognized Member Jim Stockard who made a motion to adopt the minutes from the October 25, 2022, meeting. The motion was seconded by Member Susan Shell.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                        | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen       | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jennifer Gilbert            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kai Long                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious              | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Lisa Peterson               | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Ellen Shachter              | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Susan Shell                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jim Stockard                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>          | <b>11</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>4</b>                            |
|                             | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

**The motion to amend the minutes from the October 25, 2022, meeting passed with 11 in the affirmative and 4 members recorded as absent.**

The Chair brought forward the following Communications to the Committee to be placed on file:

- Communications from Committee Members
  - Communication from Chair Kathy Born
- Communications from Council Members
  - Communication from Councillor Patricia Nolan
- Communications from the Public
  - Communication from Jameson Quinn
  - Communication from robin Chen

**Member Max Clermont** stated that they had received a communication from a member of the public via Twitter DM, Chair Born allowed Member Clermont to read the Communication into the record and asked that it also be sent via email to the Charter Committee email address.

**Chair Born recognized a motion from Member Max Clermont to place the Communications on file. The motion was seconded by Member Jim Stockard.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                        | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen       | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jennifer Gilbert            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kai Long                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious              | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Lisa Peterson               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jim Stockard                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>          | <b>13</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>2</b>                            |
|                             | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

**The motion to place the Communications received by the Committee passed with 13 members voting in the affirmative and 2 members recorded as absent.**

Chair Born introduced Elizabeth Corbo who presented the team from the Collin Center and their follow-up memo, the purpose of which is to align the themes and values discussed at the last meeting with the current Charter. Ms. Corbo identified emerging themes including enfranchising and equity, and how these tie in with the themes of participation and accessibility. Ms. Corbo stated that while some themes can't be addressed by the Charter, they were kept on the list. Ms. Corbo concluded the summary of the themes compiled in the memo with a question to the Committee of whether they would like to set a value statement where some of the emerging themes might be included. She then asked committee members for additional themes or questions.

**Member Jessica Acevedo** asked about stipends, specifically where does budget funding for these come from and who do stipends go to.

**Member Ellen Schachter** asked about incorporating technology and asked for clarification on how including this would not become obsolete quickly.

**Member Susan Shell** asked about deliberation beyond everyone getting a voice (good decision making) and whether the Charter has a role in changing the City's demographics (inclusive of working and middle class) and making it more people balanced.

**Member Nikolas Bowie** asked about how the committee will proceed, whether they will go through the charter section by section or start with key concepts and answer broader questions before narrowing down. He asked how concepts would be ordered (value statement) and what are the values that would be agreed upon. He asked what the method of decision making will be adopted by the committee. He also

asked for clarification on whether the value statement would be for the city (as in a preamble to the Charter), or values to guide decisions and operations of the committee

**Chair Born** asked about clarifying the process going forward and agreed that the committee might start by crafting a value statement.

**Anna Corning** presented a voting method called 'Fist to Five' as a method of gauging consensus among members to facilitate making decisions throughout the process, before making final votes.

**Member Lisa Petersen** asked if translation services should be required for the general operation of the city as a part of the theme of Enfranchising and Equity.

**Member Jim Stockard** stated that the committee should begin the discussion about the value statement saying that it's both important and limited and that he would look to the Collins Center to guide the committee through examples such as public financing of campaigning to increase diversity.

**Elizabeth Corbo** and **Michael Ward** engaged in conversation with the members, answering some of their questions and clarifying points in the memo. Ms. Corbo concluded the discussion of the memo by saying that once the committee decides how they want to proceed, the Collins Center will provide discussion memos, trend data, and research to inform discussions.

**Member Susan Shell** asked for clarification on what the value statement was particularly for (Committee or the preamble for the city overall). She stated that she would be uncomfortable making a value statement for the city overall.

**Ms. Corbo** stated that the only value statement being discussed was pertaining to the Charter Review Committee alone.

**Chair Born recognized a motion from Member Nikolas Bowie to discuss a value statement for the ensuing 30 minutes, with a limit of 2 minutes per member. At the request of the Chair, the Clerk took a voice vote, all members voted in the affirmative to proceed as stated in the motion**

The committee spent the next 30 minutes discussing ideas for creation of its value statement. The committee reviewed examples of value statements from other communities including Framingham and Somerville, with members suggesting ideas that they would like to have incorporated. Ms. Corbo guided the group by suggesting a 2-part solution of having a value statement and separate operating principles. Chair Born suggested that each member email values to Anna Corning and Patrick Hayes to compile and come up with an outline of values and principles for the writing committee to begin working off. Member Lisa Petersen stressed the importance of clarifying through the values the lens which the committee will define as critical in looking at the Charter. Member Nikolas Bowie made a motion to invite the Collins Center to craft a document that mirrors the City Council's division including the discussion of this and previous meetings. Anna Corning suggested that the committee members take this up, so that it is coming from the committee, with members Mina Markarios and Jessica Acevedo volunteering to work with the Collins Center to prepare such a document. Elliot Veloso (Cambridge Law Dept.) reminded the committee that there are minutes and notes to facilitate production of a committee-driven document. Member Patrick Magee suggested a friendly amendment to Member Bowie's motion that the volunteer members join with the Collins Center in a call to inform the work of the Collins Center on this document.

**Chair Born recognized the motion from Nikolas Bowie that the Collins Center work with members of the Committee to draft a value statement. The motion was seconded by member Patrick Magee.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                        | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen       | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kai Long                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jim Stockard                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>          | <b>13</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>2</b>                            |
|                             | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

**The motion that the Collins Center work with members of the Committee to draft a value statement passed with 13 members voting in the affirmative and 2 members recorded as absent.**

**The Chair opened the floor to hear from member of the public (Public Comment)**

A comment was read by Patrick Hayes that was received from Jameson Quinn

**Member Nikolas Bowie made a motion to adopt the Collins Center recommendation to proceed by discussion of general topics, starting with the structure of government, rather than going line-by-line through the Charter.**

**Chair Born recognized Member Nikolas Bowie’s motion. The motion was seconded by Member Ellen Schachter**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                        | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                 | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kai Long                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jim Stockard                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>          | <b>13</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>2</b>                            |
|                             | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

The motion to adopt the Collins Center recommendation to proceed by discussion of general topics, starting with the structure of government, rather than going line-by-line through the Charter passed with 13 members voting in the affirmative and 2 members voting absent.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:35 pm.

DRAFT

## MINUTES OF THE CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE

Tuesday, October 25, 2022

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, October 25, 2022. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30 p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this public meeting was remote via zoom.

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                        | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                 | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kai Long                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jim Stockard                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>          | <b>13</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>2</b>                            |
|                             | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

**13 members recorded as present. 2 members recorded as absent.**

The Chair gave a brief introduction of the meeting and apologized for the cancellation of the previous meeting. The Chair reaffirmed her commitment to continuing the work of the Committee and working within the Open Meeting law. The Chair then introduced Committee staff member, Anna Corning, and explained that Anna would be assisting the Committee with its work along with current staff member, Patrick Hayes. The Chair invited Anna Corning to introduce herself. Anna Corning spoke about her previous work on the Somerville charter review process, working with the Collins Center, and talked about her deep ties to Cambridge.

**Chair Born recognized Member Lisa Peterson who made a motion to amend the minutes from the meeting held on September 29, 2022, to remove a sentence on the second page. The motion was seconded by Member Susan Shell.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                        | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                 | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie               | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Kevin Chen                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kai Long                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jim Stockard                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>          | <b>12</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>3</b>                            |
|                             | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

The motion to amend the minutes from the meeting held on September 29, 2022, passed.

Chair Born made a motion to accept the minutes from the meeting held on September 29, 2022, as amended. The motion was seconded by Member Jim Stockard.

At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.

| NAME                        | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                 | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kai Long                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jim Stockard                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>          | <b>13</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>2</b>                            |
|                             | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

The motion to accept the minutes from the meeting held on September 29, 2022, as amended, passed.

The Chair took the following Communications received from the Committee to be placed on file as follows:

- Communications from Committee Members
  - Communication from Kathy Born to the City Law Department
  - [Communication from Susan Shell to Committee](#)
- Communications from Council Members
  - [Communication from Councillor Burhan Azeem to Committee](#)

**Chair Born recognized Member Jim Stockard who made a motion to place the communications received by the Committee on file. The motion was seconded by Member Lisa Peterson.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                        | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                 | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie               | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Kevin Chen                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kai Long                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jim Stockard                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>          | <b>12</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>3</b>                            |
|                             | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

**The motion to place communications received by the Committee on file passed.**

The Chair introduced Elizabeth Corbo from the Collins Center to discuss [the memo](#) of the September 9 Charter Review Committee meeting, which detailed discussion questions for this meeting. Ms. Corbo encouraged members to share things that are working well in Cambridge and things that are not working as well, acknowledging that not all issues can be addressed through the Charter, as it is a document dealing primarily with governmental operations. Ms. Corbo explained that these ideas will be incorporated into the Charter later in the process. Ms. Corbo then opened the floor for members to share their thoughts and ideas.

**Member Faria Afreen** asked questions about the City Manager in relation to the City Council, asking how planning of the annual City budget can be more democratic, funding, and a question about adding ranked choice to the Charter.

**Member Kai Long** talked about power, and the desire for more diversity as relates to finances required to become a City Councillor. She mentioned the perceived inequity in who has the resources to become a Councillor, the divide in the city between poor and rich (with the rich making decisions that effect the poor), and how to make city government more about the community and less about money.

**Member Mina Makarios** expressed support for the previous members thoughts and spoke about the need to balance the desire for more participation and democratic action without losing the benefits of having a single unitary government. He expressed concern for what happens in smaller communities when every single decision becomes a political process, particularly the longstanding housing issues becoming even more politicized and hopes to increase accountability and be nimbler.

**Member Ellen Shachter** stated the need for understood, value-driven guiding principles, regardless of the form of government going forward. She wants the committee to explore the value of a ward system, how to get feedback to the Council regarding departmental needs as relates to the budget, and public participation and stipends for more representative committees.

**Member Kevin Chen** spoke about examining some of the structural issues in the City Manager role, structure of the Council (and potential changes to consider) and injecting values into the Charter (preamble, equity lens provision).

**Member Susan Shell** shared concerns regarding clarity on what the committee is tasked with, stating that changes made now must work for future demographics in the city. She stated that there appears to be a lack of deliberation with a process where opinions can be expressed and there can be productive conversation and a genuine, deliberative public process.

**Member Jennifer Gilbert** spoke about how to encourage participation, what can lead to increased voting, and how the current form of government works in the context of increased need for regional thinking on issues including housing and climate. She spoke about the need for a system that clarifies accountability and decision-making and makes participation more approachable. She also asked if there is data comparing costs to run in other cities using some of the proposed methods.

**Member Lisa Peterson** shared appreciation for the idea of looking at the Charter with an equity lens, how the City Manager and Council can work together more effectively, and what some barriers to that might be. She called out the 2-year election cycle as one of the barriers to this efficiency, with a preference for a 4-year term, to give greater opportunity for the Council to be a team, and act as a body. She also spoke about the need for the Council to set or reaffirm goals at the start of each term for greater clarity.

**Member Patrick Magee** agreed with the members before him, adding his hope that the Collins Center will return with information regarding all that has been suggested regarding pros and cons. He said that for him, the challenges in Cambridge come down to transparency in the decisions from the City Manager, how they align with what the Council is asking for, and the impact of strong financial management. He

cited the example of the Somerville public meeting process as joint meetings of Council and City staff to increase transparency.

**Member Jim Stockard** wants to understand the technological advances/increase in technological capacity going forward, and the ability to share information as relates to facilitating productive dialogue. He shared ideas around adjusting terms and election cycles, and asked if there are ways the budget could be used to embrace ideas such as reparations, or other powers that could be enabled to better serve the community (asking what is capable through the charter).

**Member Nikolas Bowie** spoke on the importance of enacting legislation that is important to the people of Cambridge (demand more local autonomy), increased fiscal autonomy, and more democratic decision-making within the city. He talked about the structures lending primarily to those with time, money, and resources and how to enfranchise the disenfranchised (including those who work here, can't afford to live here, etc.).

**Member Jessica Acevedo** talked about a strength-based approach, and her hopes for some type of action. She said she sees the working-class being pushed out of Cambridge, the direct correlation to the affordable housing crisis here and comparing national poverty line, and the threshold affordable housing eligibility here in Cambridge. She also spoke about the other supports needed by citizens (education, family supports), equitable compensation/support for people's time to participate in these conversations and comparing Cambridge to communities farther from home (higher numbers of black and brown citizens).

**Member Ellen Schachter** added that there needs to be support in taking some risks, and ways to challenge the systems within the city that tend toward the status quo and not think out of the box.

**Member Kai Long** stated the perception of Cambridge and progressiveness, but how the city works does not reflect that. She said that in thinking about the Charter, the progressiveness needs to be reflected.

**Member Susan Shell** compared the Charter to being like a Constitution and wondered if it's the place for asserting progressiveness (as related to the purpose of the Charter). She asked that the Committee think more broadly about the common ground and not get too carried away with progressive as a label.

**Member Mina Makarios** asked whether the Collins Center and the City Solicitor could research items stuck in legislature such as non-citizen voting, rent control, and holding remote public meetings.

**Member Faria Afreen** added the need to have more information on what is possible considering legislature constraints and interest in term limits.

**Member Jim Stockard** followed Member Shell's statements regarding progressiveness as part of a preamble stating things the city strives for, including aspirational values.

**Chair Born** expressed her appreciation for the preceding discussion and spoke about elections and how the cycles can hamper collaboration. She expressed concerns about proportional representation, and the perceived impasses between the Council and the Manager (and clarity on how it works) and her preference for stability over the ups and downs of different personalities. She reminded everyone of recent successes in Cambridge, such as the city support for small businesses during COVID, including minority and women-run

businesses and the key role of the City Manager in those decisions. She concluded with thoughts about who can run for Council and how money factors into who can do so.

Ms. Corbo thanked the Committee for their thoughts and expertise, appreciating many of the common themes. She stated that at the next meeting she will walk the group through the questions and deliberations the group can undertake to incorporate the ideas shared.

The Chair announced that the Committee will appoint a 7-member planning subcommittee as well as volunteers who will work on later drafting and writing (not a subcommittee).

Member Patrick Magee asked if there should be a Vice Chair elected to help share the work.

Elliot Veloso (City Solicitors Office) said the Law Department could look into appointing of a Vice Chair, and suggested that the vote be taken to show that it is the will of the Committee to form a subcommittee and state its purpose of assisting with planning agendas.

**Chair Born recognized Member Ellen Schachter who made a motion to form a planning subcommittee. The motion was seconded by Member Jessica Acevedo.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                        | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                             | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                 | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen       | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kai Long                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jim Stockard                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>          | <b>12</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>1</b>                            | <b>2</b>                            |
|                             | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                             | ABSENT                              |

**The motion to form a planning subcommittee passed.**

## **The Chair opened the floor to hear from members of the public (Public Comment)**

*Lee Farris* thanked members for the meeting and asked if there is a way to require the Manager and Council to agree on goals and metrics. She also asked to see goals between the Manager and Council prioritized in relationship to each other. She asked if there could be an email list where people could receive notes, agendas, and materials to build participation.

*Jameson Quinn* stated their interest and expertise in voting systems and reminded the Committee that Cambridge already has ranked-choice voting and some pros and cons of this. They hope to assist in refining the voting systems/process to set it as a model.

*John Hawkinson* spoke about progressive values in the Charter being blocked by statutory or other constraints and that the Committee look carefully at how to remove some of these roadblocks. He said he would like to see the Committee take up a published calendar of milestones so members of the public can get a sense of deadlines.

The Chair committed to having a robust notification list and asked that members use their networks to advertise the meetings. She also stated that there will be some updates to the Charter review website to make further improvements.

Member Kai Long added a comment that comparing the Charter to the Constitution is upsetting as the history of misrepresentation is known, and hopes the Committee will think about what is good for all, regardless of the label of "progressive".

Member Faria Afreen asked for clarification on the purpose of the planning subcommittee. Anna Corning explained the process used by the Somerville Charter Committee, using the subcommittees to breakdown the larger decisions of the Committee. Chair Born explained that the subcommittee would discuss sequencing aspects of the charter reform.

Chair Born listed those who had expressed interest in volunteering for the planning subcommittee including Kaleb Abebe, Jennifer Gilbert, Kai Long, Susan Shell, Jessica Acevedo, Jim Stockard and Lisa Peterson. She also stated that Mina Makarious, Faria Afreen, and Ellen Shachter had volunteered to assist with writing and drafting.

Ms. Corbo further summarized next steps for the next meetings including walking through the Charter to see where the ideas shared could be reflected in a modern Charter. Member Patrick Magee restated the ask for more information regarding pros and cons/background reading that could be shared to the Committee. The Chair said that she had been asked about compiling a list of resources for background reading.

**Chair Born recognized Member Jim Stockard who made a motion to adjourn. The motion was seconded by Member Faria Afreen.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

| NAME                        | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Kaleb Abebe                 | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jessica Dejesus Acevedo     | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mosammat Faria Afreen       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kathleen Born (Chairperson) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Nikolas Bowie               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kevin Chen                  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Max Clermont                | <input type="checkbox"/>            | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Jennifer Gilbert            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Kai Long                    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Patrick Magee               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Mina Makarious              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Lisa Peterson               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Ellen Shachter              | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Susan Shell                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| Jim Stockard                | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/>            |
| <b>VOTE TOTALS</b>          | <b>13</b>                           | <b>0</b>                 | <b>0</b>                 | <b>2</b>                            |
|                             | YES                                 | NO                       | PRESENT                  | ABSENT                              |

The meeting was adjourned at 7:40 pm with 13 members voting yes, and 2 recorded as absent.

**DRAFT**

**MINUTES OF THE CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE**

**Thursday, September 29, 2022**

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Thursday, September 29, 2022. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:38 p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this public meeting was remote via zoom.

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe - Present  
Jessica Dejesus Acevedo - Present  
Mosammat Faria Afreen - Absent  
Nikolas Bowie - Absent  
Kevin Chen - Present  
Max Clermont - Present  
Jennifer Gilbert – Present (joined shortly after roll call at approximately 6:00pm)  
Kai Long – Present  
Patrick Magee – Present  
Mina Makarious - Present  
Lisa Peterson - Present  
Ellen Shachter - Present  
Susan Shell - Absent  
Jim Stockard - Absent  
Chair, Kathleen Born - Present

**11 members recorded as present. Four members recorded as absent.**

**The Chair recognized Member Ellen Shachter who made a motion to accept the minutes from the meeting held on September 13, 2022. The motion was seconded by Member Patrick Magee.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe - Yes  
Jessica Dejesus Acevedo - Yes  
Mosammat Faria Afreen - Absent  
Nikolas Bowie - Absent  
Kevin Chen - Yes  
Max Clermont - Yes  
Jennifer Gilbert - Absent  
Kai Long – Yes  
Patrick Magee – Yes  
Mina Makarious - Yes  
Lisa Peterson - Yes  
Ellen Shachter - Yes  
Susan Shell - Absent

Jim Stockard - Absent

Chair, Kathleen Born – Yes

**The vote was 10 – Yes, and 5-Absent. The motion to accept the minutes from the meeting held on September 13, 2022, passed.**

The Chair gave an overview of her idea for the forming of subcommittees. The two subcommittees described were for “Agenda Setting” and “Drafting/Writing”. The Chair clarified her goals for the subcommittees and took a question from Member Ellen Shachter regarding the details of subcommittees. Libby Corbo of the Collins Center answered some questions from the Chair on their role in drafting language. Member Mina Makarious directed several questions to the City Solicitor’s office regarding how subcommittee work relates to open meeting law. Elliot Veloso of the City Solicitor’s office indicated that their office had concerns about the role subcommittees could play. The Chair asked Libby Corbo how other cities across Massachusetts worked within subcommittees and broadly the role that other city law departments played within a review process. Libby Corbo indicated that they typically do not have much interaction with city law departments at all during their work, but said that she had spoken on the phone with City Solicitor Nancy Glowa who said that the City Solicitor’s Office should be involved throughout the process. Elliot Veloso further stated his concern about the adherence to open meeting law and questioned whether the subcommittees, as currently understood, would be feasible under the law. The Chair and Elliot Veloso began an extended conversation about open meeting law and subcommittee work. Lisa Peterson asked Elliot Veloso about forming less formal, non-decision making, subcommittee groups to assist in scheduling and agenda-setting. Elliot Veloso indicated his skepticism in the ability of the Committee to work in subcommittees without breaking the open meeting law. Elliot Veloso then began reciting the open meeting law briefing materials from the Massachusetts Attorney General’s website.

The Chair recognized a comment from a member of the public commenting on the subcommittee work. Member Jennifer Gilbert asked about other ways to overcome the logistical challenges of planning for meetings. Member Max Clermont asked about simply expanding the current planning process to make the subcommittee less formal. Elliot Veloso again recited from the Attorney General’s guidance on open meeting law. Member Kai Long indicated her concern about City support for the Committee if it would be able to live up to the City Solicitor’s expectations under the law. Other members indicated agreement with the pressures of adhering to open meeting law without communicating outside of meeting times. Elliot Veloso indicated the law department would need to look into the issue further. Committee staff, Patrick Hayes, indicated that the Committee should move onto other business because of time restraints. The Chair indicated that she preferred to come to a conclusion on the issue of subcommittee work. Libby Corbo suggested that the discussion continue between the Chair, the law department, and the Collins Center after the meeting, as the Committee is limited by time restraints. The Chair asked the law department whether she could call a vote to form a subcommittee to begin agenda-setting. Elliot Veloso indicated there were still concerns about open meeting law. The discussion continued until approximately 6:45pm.

**The Chair recognized Member Patrick Magee who made a motion to enter into the public record the email communications from the Chair to the entire Committee from September 22, 2022 and September 29, 2022. The motion was seconded by Member Kevin Chen.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe - Yes

Jessica Dejesus Acevedo - Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen - Absent

Nikolas Bowie - Absent

Kevin Chen - Yes

Max Clermont - Yes

Jennifer Gilbert - Yes

Kai Long – Yes

Patrick Magee – Yes

Mina Makarious - Yes

Lisa Peterson - Yes

Ellen Shachter - Yes

Susan Shell - Absent

Jim Stockard - Absent

Chair, Kathleen Born – Yes

**The vote was 11 – Yes, and 4-Absent. The motion to accept two email communications from the Chair to the Committee, passed.** The two email communications are attached to these minutes.

The Chair recognized several comments from the public on the open meeting law and subcommittee discussion. The Chair introduced a memo from the Collins Center with discussion questions. A copy of the memo is attached to these minutes. The Chair recognized Member Max Clermont who brought up a discussion of how to engage with public discussion going forward. The Chair described in detail her ideas for public input and recognized several Members for their ideas as well. Members Chen, Long, Clermont, Gilbert, Acevedo, Abebe, Magee, and Peterson indicated their thoughts on public engagement.

Members Peterson and Long, and the Chair indicated their further frustrations with the law department’s opinion on the Committee’s agenda-setting ability. Elliot Veloso again warned members about discussing any matters of substance outside of formal meetings. The Chair noted that she had a discussion with the City Manager about providing further staff options to assist the Committee with its work. Elliot Veloso again recited directly from the Attorney General’s website to assist the Committee in understanding open meeting law and their limitations.

The Chair recognized Libby Corbo to discuss the Collins Center’s role in agenda setting and the broad timeline of their work. Members Abebe, Shachter, and Makarious added their thoughts on the timeline of the work.

**Chair Born called for public comment at 7:15pm.** Two members of the public announced themselves to speak, John Hawkinson and Jameson Quinn. John Hawkinson made a comment about public comment generally and a comment on the drafting subcommittee. Jameson Quinn asked about commenting in the Q&A zoom function and thanked the Committee for their discussions.

The Chair indicated at 7:20pm that they should begin discussing the Collins Center memo with discussion topics. Noting the time, Libby Corbo indicated that given the time it might be pertinent to hear from Committee members. Kai Long talked about the ability of the City to be responsive to the needs of the community. Mina Makarious talked about which City services can be addressed by the Charter and which services are outside of the Charter recommendations. Ellen Shachter spoke about how short terms for City Councillors can hamper the responsiveness of elected officials. Lisa Peterson spoke about language barriers for folks in the City and reiterated Ellen Shachter's thoughts on term length for elected officials. Jessica Acevedo spoke about working to commit as a City to business owners who are people of color and providing more opportunities for people of color to become business stakeholders in Cambridge. Patrick Magee brought up the pros and cons on geographical representation and at-large, elected officials. Libby Corbo talked about how all these different issues have solutions that can be found in the Charter review process.

**The Chair recognized Member Lisa Peterson who made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 7:30pm. The motion was seconded by Member Ellen Shachter.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe - Yes

Jessica Dejesus Acevedo - Yes

Mosammat Faria Afreen - Absent

Nikolas Bowie - Absent

Kevin Chen - Yes

Max Clermont - Yes

Jennifer Gilbert - Yes

Kai Long – Yes

Patrick Magee – Yes

Mina Makarious - Yes

Lisa Peterson - Yes

Ellen Shachter - Yes

Susan Shell - Absent

Jim Stockard - Absent

Chair, Kathleen Born – Yes

**The vote was 11 – Yes, and 4-Absent. The motion to adjourn passed.**

**Chair Born announced that the next meeting would be on Tuesday, October 11, 2022, at 5:30 p.m. and it would be via zoom.**

**There being no further business before the Committee, the Chair adjourned the meeting at 7:32 p.m.**

Attachments: Communications to the Committee (not discussed)  
Communications to the Committee from the Chair  
Collins Center Memo – September 29, 2022

**DRAFT**

**MINUTES OF THE CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE**

**Tuesday, September 13, 2022**

The Cambridge Charter Review Committee held a meeting on Tuesday, September 13, 2022. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:33 p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this public meeting was remote via zoom.

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe - Present  
Jessica Dejesus Acevedo - Present  
Mosammat Faria Afreen - Present  
Nikolas Bowie - Absent  
Kevin Chen - Present  
Max Clermont - Present  
Jennifer Gilbert - Present  
Patrick Magee – Present (joined shortly after roll call)  
Kai Long - Present  
Mina Makarious - Present  
Lisa Peterson - Present  
Ellen Shachter - Present  
Susan Shell - Present  
Jim Stockard - Present  
Chair, Kathleen Born - Present

**14 members recorded as present. One member recorded as absent.**

Chair Born gave an overview of what would be covered in this meeting including the adoption of rules, acceptance of the minutes from the last meeting, a presentation by the Collins Center, and public comment.

The Chair offered that the Committee would be following Robert’s Rules and referenced a “Robert Rules Cheat Sheet” that was provided to members and is attached to these minutes.

**The Chair recognized Member Jim Stockard who made a motion to accept Roberts Rules as the rules of the Charter Review Committee. The motion was seconded by Mina Makarious.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe - Yes  
Jessica Dejesus Acevedo - Yes  
Mosammat Faria Afreen - Yes  
Nikolas Bowie - Absent  
Kevin Chen - Yes  
Max Clermont - Yes  
Jennifer Gilbert - Yes  
Patrick Magee – Yes

Kai Long - Yes  
Mina Makarios - Yes  
Lisa Peterson - Yes  
Ellen Shachter - Yes  
Susan Shell - Yes  
Jim Stockard - Yes  
Chair, Kathleen Born – Yes

**The vote was 14 – Yes, and 1-Absent. The motion to accept Roberts Rules as the Rules of the Committee passed.**

**The Chair recognized Member Kaleb Abebe who made a motion to accept the minutes from the meeting held on August 16, 2022. The motion was seconded by Member Jim Stockard.**

**At the request of the Chair, the Clerk called the roll.**

Kaleb Abebe - Yes  
Jessica Dejesus Acevedo - Yes  
Mosammat Faria Afreen - Yes  
Nikolas Bowie - Absent  
Kevin Chen - Yes  
Max Clermont - Yes  
Jennifer Gilbert - Yes  
Patrick Magee – Yes  
Kai Long - Yes  
Mina Makarios - Yes  
Lisa Peterson - Yes  
Ellen Shachter - Yes  
Susan Shell - Yes  
Jim Stockard - Yes  
Chair, Kathleen Born – Yes

**The vote was 14 – Yes, and 1-Absent. The motion to accept the minutes from the meeting held on August 16, 2022, passed.**

The Chair recognized Michael Ward from the Collins Center to make a presentation. Michael Ward noted that the presentation would cover Collins Center Background, Municipal Government, Charter Basics and Process, and Cambridge Government and Charter. Michael Ward also noted that there would be time for questions and that Elizabeth Corbo, Patricia Lloyd and Marilyn Contreas were present and would be participating in the presentation. The representatives from the Collins Center made their presentation which took approximately 50 minutes. The complete presentation is attached to these minutes.

The Chair recognized Patrick Hayes to call upon members who had questions. Patrick Hayes recognizes members Shachter, Stockard, Afreen, Abebe, Chen, Shell, Long, Makarios, and Peterson who offered comments and asked questions that were addressed by representatives of the Collins Center. Among the several questions asked was “Can the Charter be aspirational?” “Can we contact the Collins Center directly” and “What will the process look like”. It was noted

that members should not contact the Collins Center directly, but rather should send their inquiry to the Chair.

**Chair Born announced that the next meeting would be on Thursday, September 29, 2022, at 5:30 p.m. and it would be via zoom.**

**Chair Born called for public comment.** Only one member of the public announced themselves to speak. John Hawkinson asked if a list could be maintained of individuals who want to be notified of meetings and receive all materials related to the work of the Committee. John Hawkinson also noted that there needed to be process for signing up for public participation as is done with other public bodies. John Hawkinson asked about a comment made earlier asking Committee members to email and copy all noting that this could appear to be an open meeting law violation.

The Chair addressed Mr. Hawkinson's comments noting that she appreciated the comments and that she and the Committee are sensitive to the requirements of the open meeting law. The Chair reiterated her commitment to providing opportunities for public comment.

**There being no further business before the Committee, the Chair adjourned the meeting at 7:34 p.m.**

Attachments: Roberts Rules Cheat Sheet

Collins Center Presentation – September 13, 2022

**DRAFT MINUTES OF THE CHARTER REVIEW COMMITTEE**  
**Tuesday, August 16, 2022**

The first meeting of the Cambridge Charter Review Committee was held on Tuesday, August 16, 2022. The meeting was called to order at 5:06 p.m. by the Chair of the Committee, Kathleen Born. Pursuant to Chapter 20 of the Acts of 2022 adopted by Massachusetts General Assembly and approved by the Governor, this public meeting was remote via zoom.

Chair Born opened the meeting and stated the purpose of the meeting noting that it was introductory and informational. The Chair further noted there would be a presentation from the Collins Center but that there would not be a presentation from the City's Law Department.

At the request of the Chair, Clerk LeBlanc called the roll.

Kaleb Abebe - Present  
Jessica Dejesus Acevedo - Present  
Mosammat Faria Afreen - Present  
Nikolas Bowie - Present  
Kevin Chen - Present  
Max Clermont - Present  
Jennifer Gilbert - Present  
Patrick Magee - Present  
Kai Long - Present  
Mina Makarious - Present  
Lisa Peterson - Present  
Ellen Shachter - Present  
Susan Shell - Present  
Jim Stockard - Present  
Chair, Kathleen Born

Chair Born acknowledged Michael Ward from the Collins Center. He gave a brief introduction to the Collins Center noting its mission and specifically their Charter related work and that they are currently working with Beverly, Somerville and Plymouth. Michael Ward then turned it over to Elizabeth Carbo of the Collins Center who will be the Project Team Leader. Elizabeth Carbo introduced herself noting she has four years with the Collins Center and is an elected official. Patricia Lloyd from the Collins Center spoke next, noting her experience including 30 years as an attorney.

The Chair then acknowledged the City Solicitor, Nancy Glowa who was present along with Deputy City Solicitor, Megan Bayer and Assistant City Solicitor Elliott Veloso. Solicitor Glowa indicated that one of them would be at each meeting of the Charter Review Committee to answer any legal questions the Committee might have. Solicitor Glowa further stated that at this meeting, Deputy Solicitor Megan Bayer would be providing an overview of the three statues that applied to the Committee; the Open Meeting Law, the Public Records Law, and the Conflict of Interest Law. It was also noted that the Clerk's Office would provide members with the required Open Meeting Law materials and the Conflict of Interest materials.

Deputy Solicitor Megan Bayer provided the overview of the three statues. The Chair asked the Committee if they had questions. There being no questions, the Chair stated that the next order of business was Committee Member introductions.

The Chair noted how thrilled she was to be working with the individuals on the Committee who were selected from 122 applicants. The Chair also noted that she is committed to public input. The Chair asked each Committee member to say their name, where they live in the City, and a little about why they applied to serve on the Committee. The Chair acknowledged Patrick Hayes who was serving as the zoom facilitator to call upon members. Patrick Hayes called upon the following Committee members who introduced themselves; Kaleb Abebe, Jessica Dejesus Acevedo, Mosammat Faria Afreen, Nikolas Bowie, Kevin Chen, Max Clermont, Jennifer Gilbert, Patrick Magee, Kai Long, Mina Makarious, Lisa Peterson, Ellen Shachter, Susan Shell, Jim Stockard, and Chair, Kathleen Born. Patrick Hayes thanked everyone for their introductions and noted that going forward, he would be providing administrative support to the Committee. The Chair also thanked the Committee members for their inspiring introductions.

Chair Born raised the topic of scheduling meetings and noted the challenges of competing with other City entities. The Chair did an informal survey of the membership regarding what days of the week were best. The Chair noted that the Committee needed to do its work in time to make recommendations to the City Council to put on the ballot at the next November election. The Chair noted that working out the schedule would take more time and that she would be in touch with members.

The Chair then acknowledged that there were 35 participants for the meeting which included several members of the public. The Chair thanked everyone for being at the meeting.

The Chair adjourned the meeting at 6:08 p.m.

**Clerk's Note:** The video for this meeting can be viewed at:

[https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/307?view\\_id=1&redirect=true&h=d16a3abf50e6f79f112a6ccd585a3dc7](https://cambridgema.granicus.com/player/clip/307?view_id=1&redirect=true&h=d16a3abf50e6f79f112a6ccd585a3dc7)

The closed-captioned transcript is available online at:

<https://app.box.com/s/9qormcahynjt4pzpt1n5opixogl3q7k5>